



LIVERY TRANSPORT ADVISORY COMMITTEE

MINUTES of MEETING
COMMENCING 2017, February 2 AT 12:10 PM
Clarion Hotel and Conference Centre Calgary
2120 16th Avenue Northeast

PLATE UTILIZATION (THE SUBCOMMITTEE)

MEMBERS PRESENT: Spencer Villiam – Calgary Hotel Association, Subcommittee Chair
Lauri Brunner – Advisory Committee on Accessibility, Subcommittee Vice Chair
Kurt Enders – Taxi Broker
Ginger Greenwood – Transportation Network Company
Phillip Schuman – Community Member
Stewart Lang – Community Member

MEMBERS ABSENT: Gordon Lowe – General Public
Tongjie Zhang – General Public- LTAC Chair (ex-officio)

CITY SUPPORT STAFF PRESENT:
Marcia Andreychuk – LTAC Business Analyst (note taker)
Jodi Hughes – Issue Strategist
Carissa Vescio – Business Strategist

ASCERTAIN QUORUM

The Chair ascertained that quorum was present.

CONFIRMATION OF AGENDA

CONFIRM AGENDA, Moved by Kurt Enders that the Agenda for today's meeting be confirmed. **CARRIED**

CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES

CONFIRM MINUTES, Moved by Lauri Brunner that the Minutes of the 2017, September 8 meeting of the Plate Utilization Subcommittee be confirmed. **CARRIED**

DECLARATION OF PECUNIARY INTEREST

The following persons declared a pecuniary interest:

Kurt Enders, Taxi Broker
Ginger Greenwood, Transportation Network Company

CHAIR'S OPENING REMARKS

The Chair thanked everyone for attending.

ELECTION OF SUBCOMMITTEE VICE CHAIR

The Chair announced that a Vice Chair needed to be elected for the Plate Utilization Subcommittee and called for nominations. Kurt Enders nominated Stewart Lang. The request for nominations was made two more times with no other names provided. Motion by Ginger Greenwood to close nominations.
CARRIED.

Nominations were then declared closed by the Chair. Due to only one nomination presented, the Chair declared Stewart Lang as the Vice Chair.

NEW BUSINESS **DISCUSSION RE: Response to 2016 Dec 19 Council direction:**
REFER, Moved by Councillor Colley-Urquhart, Seconded by Councillor Carra, that Report CPS2016-0898 be referred to the Administration to undertake an accessible transportation policy scoping Report between Calgary Transit Access and Livery Transport Services which:

- 1. Addresses the immediate impact of Transportation Network Companies operations on the Accessible Taxi system;*
- 2. Explores opportunities to collaborate on service delivery for the accessible taxi community;*
- 3. Develops potential short-term fixes for the situation; and*
- 4. Considers the options presented in Attachment 2.*

And further, that the Administration Report back to Council no later than 2017 Q1.

Administration provided a brief preamble on progress since December 19:

- Early stage discussions with Calgary Transit Access (CTA); nothing to report at this time
- Impact of TNCs on taxi system is TBD; Addressing the impacts is another discussion.

Administration presented some initial concepts for potential short term fixes.

1. Given:

- higher capital and operating costs, compensation is not equitable between TPL and ATPL
 - ~20,000 wheelchair trips annually is $\frac{1}{4}$ of 1%
 - higher average deadhead to pick-up location can result in a more trip refusals (refusal to leave zone)
 - Accessible Taxi Plate Licenses (ATPLs) are distributed mostly between 2 brokers; this means there is a roughly 50% chance that closest vehicle is dispatched for each trip requested
2. Unknown:
- What is the optimal number of ATPLs to serve 20,000 trips and regain trust, increase business?

Options discussed:

1. Revert to December 19 recommendation (i.e., Transition all ATPLs to TPLs; open entry to Licensed Brokerages for ATPLs; each ATPL would come with two TPLs to cross-subsidize the costs, aiming for break-even; conditions for ATPL being in operation and minimum performance standards would apply)
2. Partial transfer of ATPLs to TPLs; centralize dispatch of ATPLs trips through RFP; create a **mill rate funded** incentive tied to minimizing trip refusals.
 - Rationale for decreasing fleet size: The ATPL fleet size could be reduced by half with little or no impact if all ATPLs were dispatched together. This would guarantee that the closest vehicle attends
 - How?
 - Convert $\frac{1}{2}$ of all active ATPLs to TPLs. (Of the 189 ATPLs specified in the bylaw, 10 have been permanently divested back to LTS leaving 179, which of half is ~90). Which ones to be converted is for discussion. By class? By performance based on service data? Other?
 - Provide an incentive to remaining ~90 ATPLs tied to minimal trip refusals (e.g., 95% non-refusal rate regardless of deadhead distance).
 - For debate: amount of incentive (e.g., \$10,000/year based on \$15,000 capital and \$7000 operating over 5 years = \$50,000; amount could be adjusted to reflect optimal operation for reduced maintenance costs and other 'deduction' considerations)
 - 'Ballpark' cost of \$600,000/yr allowing for ATPLs to choose whether or not to participate, and not including ATPLs (~20) that are dedicated to Calgary Transit Access service.
 - RFP process would require ATPL holders to affiliate with the successful bidder in order to participate in the incentive
3. Same as #2 above except funded a redistributed trip surcharge on all taxi and TNC fares (e.g., 7M trips in 2017 x 10c = \$700,000).

Note: The stakeholder engagement conducted throughout 2016 clearly indicated that this option was not popular among industry. It would also be a more

administrative-intensive solution. The subcommittee expressed the sentiment that option #2 is preferable to option #3; as a city-wide value, all Calgarians ought to contribute to the solution through mill rate funding.

4. Offload the delivery of on demand wheelchair accessible trips entirely to Calgary Transit Access at an unknown mill rate cost compared to the estimated \$600,000/yr for option #2.
5. Maintain the system status quo EXCEPT provide priority access to ATPLs at desirable taxi stand locations (e.g., reserve the Bankers Hall taxi stand for ATPLs) and at the airport (e.g., a separate, priority queue at the Airport for airport-contracted ATPLs) on the condition of minimal trip refusals (e.g., 95% non-refusal rate regardless of deadhead distance or position in any queue). The impact to TPLs was discussed with the suggestion that that license fees for TPLs be reduced for losing equal privileges in these areas.
6. Address vehicle-type discrimination concerns (i.e., when a customer bypasses a wheelchair taxi for whatever reason) by developing a 'please don't pass me by' public awareness campaign to inform all taxi users that they are helping support the wheelchair accessible system when they take rides in wheelchair accessible taxis. The subcommittee suggested that this potential initiative be forwarded to the Communication, Engagement and Research Subcommittee for action.

Other short-term fixes mentioned:

- Reduce ATPL fees from \$220 to \$0
- ½ fleet size, otherwise status quo
- Per trip surcharge redistributed based on the number of wheelchair trips taken (as opposed to being based on 95% non-refusal rate)
- One-time lump sum capital subsidy for vehicle conversion (mill rate)
- Extend permissible life of ATPL vehicle from 8 to 10 years

EXCUSING ABSENCE OF MEMBERS: NONE

ADJOURNMENT

ADJOURN, Moved by Lauri Brunner that the meeting adjourn. (2:10 p.m.) **CARRIED**

S. Villiam, Chair

L. Brunner, Vice Chair