

### 1. The issue

Calgarians enjoy one of the highest standards of living and lowest percentage of people living in poverty in Canada. In Calgary in 2011, 6.6 per cent of the population lived below Statistics Canada's after-tax Low-income Cut-off (LICO). Both the youngest and oldest segments of the population also fared well, with 5.6 per cent of children under the age of 18 (2011) and 2.8 per cent of seniors (2010) and 8.7 per cent (2009) of unattached seniors living below LICO.<sup>1</sup> The most recently available data, however, show members of the following five other groups were more likely to live in low-income:

- 1. Persons in female lone-parent families (24.8 per cent, Calgary, 2011).<sup>1</sup>
- Unattached women (42.7 per cent, Calgary, 2011) and men (20.4 per cent, Calgary, 2011) under the age of 65 years.<sup>1</sup>
- 3. Aboriginal people (28.0 per cent, Calgary, 2005).<sup>2</sup>
- 4. People with disabilities, primarily those under the age of 65 years (13.7 per cent, Alberta, 2006).<sup>3</sup>
- 5. Recent immigrants (17.2 per cent, Canada, 2010).<sup>4</sup>

Members of these five groups are at risk of social exclusion. While it also has broader meanings, the term "social exclusion" is sometimes used interchangeably with poverty. It is also sometimes invoked as a partial explanation for serious, long-term financial deprivation<sup>5</sup> or gross disparities in income. That is to say when an individual's "resources are so seriously below those commanded by the average individual or family that they are, in effect, excluded from ordinary living patterns, customs and activities."<sup>6</sup> In other words, social exclusion may be considered both the cause and the symptom of poverty and relative

poverty, reflecting bi-directional, additive and, often, cyclical effects. A range of social and economic factors and personal characteristics combine to propel individuals and families into chronic low income and, in many cases, to keep them there. As observed by economist and Nobel laureate Amartya Sen, once excluded, an individual is not only poor, he is removed from access to the means of improving his lot in life.<sup>7</sup>

Social exclusion is a relatively new term in social policy discourse. It stems from the "rising incidence of long-term unemployment coupled with the persistence and concentration of low income over the last three decades," (p. 5 in <sup>5</sup>) along with growing income disparity between the richest and poorest citizens. Between 1995 and 2010, the income disparity between Alberta families in the top and bottom 20 per cent income groups increased by 41 per cent (\$120,900). Average after-tax income rose by 12 per cent for the bottom 20 per cent of families, and by 37 per cent for the top 20 per cent of families.<sup>4</sup> This means that, in 2010, families in the top 20 per cent income bracket (after tax) had an income 8.7 times higher than those in the bottom 20 per cent.<sup>4</sup> In short, poor families are somewhat better off than in the past, but much worse off relative to upper income families, for whom income has escalated.

Both poverty and income inequality are associated with myriad problems for both individuals and society as a whole. Holzer, et al., note the harms associated with poverty include:

- An undereducated and under-skilled workforce.
- A reduced market for goods and services to fuel the economy.
- Increases in illness, violence, and crime.
- Devaluation of life.8

#### **APRIL** 2020

# Introduction to FCSS research brief

This research brief is one of a series provided for FCSS-funded organizations and others in the field of preventive social services focused on enhancing social inclusion. It provides researchbased information/statistics on the issue, risk and protective factors, and guidance on programming, but is not intended to serve as a comprehensive program development toolkit.

The 2020 version of the Individual and family economic self-sufficiency research brief is organized into the same three sections as the 2014 version:

- 1. The issue
- 2. Risk and protective factors
- 3. What works

Each section begins with the context from the 2014 version and is followed by a 2020 update. The 2020 updates provide more recent statistics and curated lists of resources/links readers can access for more detailed information on each topic.

#### In partnership with



**Acknowledgement:** The content in the original text sections was written for FCSS by Merrill Cooper, Guyn Cooper Research Associates Ltd. and was first published in 2014.

**Suggested citation:** Calgary Neighbourhoods. 2020. Individual and family economic self-sufficiency. (Calgary, AB: Family & Community Support Services, The City of Calgary).

At the individual level, problems correlated with low income and, probably, even more highly correlated with income disparities include:

- Mental health and drug abuse.
- · Physical health and life expectancy.
- Obesity.
- · Educational performance.
- · Births to teenaged mothers.
- Violence and social disorder.<sup>9</sup>

Children are particularly affected by poverty, especially in early childhood, because the association between low-income and poor outcomes is greatest at this stage and because problems developed early in life can "snowball" into larger problems later in life.<sup>10</sup>

This brief focuses on initiatives and interventions non-profit organizations might undertake that have been demonstrated to be effective or have shown promise in increasing adults' economic self-sufficiency or increasing their capacity to become economically self-sufficient. "Self-sufficiency" is defined here as:

- The ability to earn or obtain sufficient income and resources and/or reduce expenses to consistently meet one's own and one's family's basic needs.
- Maintain stable and functional households.
- Plan for the future.
- Participate in all aspects of community life.

#### FIGURE 1: ADULT AND FAMILY SELF-SUFFICIENCY OUTCOMES

Domain	Desired outcomes	
Income	<ul> <li>Increased individual or family income through earnings and/or social benefits/transfers.</li> </ul>	
Assets	• Increased individual or family assets (e.g., savings, equipment/tool ownership, home ownership).	
Employment	<ul> <li>Increased earnings.</li> <li>Improved employment conditions (e.g., permanency/security, hours of work, benefits, union membership, opportunities for advancement).</li> </ul>	
Expenses	• Decreased individual or family expenses (e.g., food, shelter, transportation, debt reduction/elimination).	
Personal capital	• Increased personal capital (e.g., education/training certification, employment experience, workplace skills, recogniti of foreign credentials).	
Social capital	Increased social ties in the world of work.	

#### 2020 update

City of Calgary Community Profiles, available at calgary.ca/communities, provide demographic, economic, and housing information for each community and comparison data for Calgary as a whole.

- A 2013 systematic review of research<sup>11</sup> found that, since the 1980s, family and child homelessness has become more pervasive.
- In 2017 the Government of Canada National Housing Strategy<sup>12</sup> found that 1.7 million Canadians were living in homes that were inadequate or unaffordable.
- Using the Market Basket Measure (MBM)
   8.7 per cent of Canada's population was living in poverty, compared to 9.7 per cent for Calgary.
  - The percent is much higher for people in Calgary not living in families, 26.9 per cent.<sup>13</sup>

- Between 2014 and 2018, income inequality increased in Alberta but remained steady in Canada as a whole, using the Gini coefficient. (See Stats Can Table 11-10-0134-01 for details.<sup>14</sup>
- Some groups of people had a higher prevalence of living in low income:
- In Canada, overall, there are a higher proportion of women, than men, living in low income (meaning their adjusted income is less than half the overall median). The gender-gap in poverty is especially large for seniors and lone mothers.<sup>15</sup>
- Alberta has the second-highest genderwage gap in Canada with women earning \$6.32 less, per hour, than men in 2018.<sup>16</sup>

- In 2016 using after-tax Low Income Cut Off (LICO) in Calgary, 8.9 per cent of the visible minority population were in low-income status compared to 7.1 per cent of people not classified as a visible minority.<sup>17</sup>
- In 2016 using after-tax Low Income Cut Off (LICO) in Calgary, 8.9 per cent of immigrants were in low-income compared to 7.6 per cent of non-immigrants.<sup>18</sup>

### 2. Risk and protective factors

Preventing any social problem begins with the clear identification of its causes. As noted above, poverty and social exclusion are most often the direct result of low workforce participation and/or low earnings now or in the past. The reasons are both structural and individual, sometimes in combination, and vary somewhat among at-risk groups.

At the structural level, the primary reasons include:

- Growing demand for skilled labour due to technological changes and globalization in conjunction with increased polarization between highly educated and uneducated workers.
- Institutional changes relating to labour (e.g., declining unionization rates, stagnating minimum wage rates, changes to employment insurance, deregulation),<sup>19</sup> along with other federal policy shifts toward individual over collective rights and responsibilities.
- Employment challenges caused or exacerbated by discrimination and racism against members of some groups.
- Language and cultural barriers and lack of recognition of foreign credentials, which often serve as additional employment hurdles for recent immigrants.

For the most part, structural issues can only be addressed through economic and social policy levers and large-scale programming, including:

- Income transfers (social assistance, tax measures, and so on).
- · Child care benefits.
- Housing.
- Job creation.
- Work incentives.
- Education across the lifespan.
- Skills training.
- Human rights (for example, see <sup>20</sup>).

For example, Canada's most successful poverty prevention and reduction strategy to date has arguably been the Guaranteed Income Supplement (GIS). In conjunction with the Canada Pension Plan and Old Age Security, the GIS dramatically reduced the percentage of Canadian seniors living below LICO. It fell from about 44 per cent among couples and about 70 per cent among unattached seniors in the 1960s,<sup>21</sup> to five per cent among all seniors and 15 per cent among unattached seniors in 2011.<sup>1</sup>

Economic and social policy strategies and large-scale programming to prevent and reduce poverty and social exclusion are well beyond the mandate and capacity of FCSS and the programs it funds. Many, however, are included among the recommendations of the Standing Senate committee on Social Affairs, Science and Technology in its thorough 2009 report, In From The Margins: A Call to Action on Poverty Housing, and Homelessness.<sup>22</sup> Therefore, this brief sometimes mentions such strategies in order to provide a more comprehensive poverty prevention picture and to illustrate what kinds of smaller-scale interventions are likely or unlikely to be effective, but does not describe them in depth.

At the individual level, reasons for poverty and social exclusion include low levels of:

- 1. Personal capital (e.g., education, literacy, skills, workforce experience and workplace skills).
- 2. Personal capacity (e.g., work-limiting disabilities or illness, skills for daily living, interpersonal skills).
- 3. Social capital, particularly useful ties in the world of work.
- Life circumstances (e.g., caregiving responsibilities, family break-up).

The most effective means of preventing and reducing poverty in the next generation is to ensure children are nurtured, develop optimally, and achieve their full potential as adults (See *Positive child and youth development* and *Positive parenting and family functioning* research briefs).

### 2020 update

Recent publications about risk and protective factors include:

- Phase 1 of Evaluation of Guaranteed Income Support in Canada<sup>23</sup>
- Income Inequality in Canada: Driving Forces, Outcomes and Policy<sup>24</sup>
- Canada's Poverty Reduction Strategy An Update<sup>25</sup>

# 3. What works to increase economic self-sufficiency and capacity for self-sufficiency

#### 3.1 Guaranteed annual income

A guaranteed annual income (GAI) for all Canadians, possibly, but not necessarily structured like the seniors' Guaranteed Income Supplement, has re-emerged among recommendations for preventing and reducing poverty. Some policy think tanks have addressed the need for a GAI (for example, see <sup>26,27</sup>) and the Senate of Canada has recommended it.<sup>22</sup> In most proposals, however, the GAI would replace social assistance and, possibly, other particular transfers. It would provide a "minimum level of core income... on a continuing basis by the state, to which everyone is entitled irrespective of personal circumstances or need, subject to no or very few conditions of eligibility, such as work requirements"(page 7 in <sup>27</sup>). In other words, everyone with

an annual income below an established minimum would receive the benefit.

Renewed interest in Canada in a GAI is based in part on the long-neglected and recently unearthed outcomes of Canada's MINCOME experiment in the 1970s. In that experiment, the government gave an income supplement to residents of Dauphin, Manitoba, a relatively self-contained agricultural community. Dauphin residents were guaranteed that if their incomes fell below a certain threshold each year (in this community, usually due to crop prices for that year), they would receive an income supplement. Curiously, the data collected over the course of and following the five-year experiment were shelved and

only recently unearthed and analyzed by Forget, a University of Manitoba researcher. From the data she was able to recover, Forget identified numerous positive outcomes for residents, whether they had received the supplement or not, including declines in high school dropout and increases in post-secondary education enrollment (apparently because youth did not drop out of school to work on family farms), and declines in physician and hospital visits, including visits arising from domestic violence, work-related injuries, and mental health issues. Forget concluded that a relatively modest GAI would improve population health, resulting in significant reductions in health care expenditures.<sup>28</sup>

### 3.2 Increased employment and earnings

Employment is not the only pathway out of poverty. For some people, such as seniors and some people with work-limiting disabilities, employment is not a feasible or appropriate pathway. However, most adults who can work want to do so, and they want to earn sufficient wages to support themselves and their families. Employment, however, is not always sufficient to prevent social exclusion. Among low-income families in Canada, more than half include at least one member who is employed. Families in which one member is employed are referred to as "employed low-income families." About 60 per cent of people in employed low-income families are aged 25 to 44 years, 58 per cent are women, and they have more children than average. About half of employed low-income families are couples with children and 15 per cent are lone parents.29

In addition, multiple studies have shown moving from welfare to work does not always increase income and, in some cases, it actually increases poverty (for example, see <sup>30,31</sup>). Moreover, motivating welfare recipients to seek and retain what may be precarious employment can be difficult and may not always prevent social exclusion. "Precarious" jobs are characterized by few benefits, lack of job security, low wages, and other poor working conditions.<sup>34-36</sup> Poor working conditions can include long working hours, lack of paid and unpaid time off, non-payment of overtime and statutory holidays, dangerous working conditions and/or harassment and abuse on the job. Some workers may have access to a range of employment protections and benefits, but are unable to access them due to lack of control in the workplace, lack of awareness of their rights, and/or ineffective enforcement and compliance mechanisms.<sup>34-36</sup>

Yet, within a broader anti-poverty agenda that includes social services, health care, and income transfers to ensure that those who cannot work are able to fully participate in society, it is widely recognized participation in paid employment is an important dimension of social inclusion.37,38 For most people, having a job is better than not having one. Even though employed lowincome families experience serious economic hardship and their income, adjusted for family size, is less than one-third that of non-low-income families, most are economically better off and more financially secure than not employed low-income families. In 2009, employed low-income families had a higher median household

income (\$25,000 or \$15,000 adjusted for family size) than those which rely on transfers and forms of income other than wages (\$15,000 or \$11,000 adjusted for family size). Employed low-income families are also more likely to accumulate assets than nonemployed low-income families. They are more likely to own their homes, own RRSPs and RESPs, and business assets. They are also more likely to be in debt, although this is primarily due to mortgages. In addition, they are more likely to have at least some savings set aside for a period of financial hardship or an unexpected expense.<sup>29</sup> Research also indicates employment can confer benefits beyond income. People in employed lowincome families experience better health than people in not-employed low-income families and health outcomes similar to that of people in employed middle- and upper-income families.39

For those who are able to work, the key to preventing social exclusion is employment in non-precarious jobs. However, it is generally agreed that less-educated workers will be unable to advance without at least some postsecondary training and relevant work experience; better access to higher-wage employers and economic sectors; and other financial supports and services.

#### 3.2.1. Living wage

A "living wage" can be described as a wage that provides sufficient income to afford the basics of life.<sup>40</sup> It can be defined and calculated in different ways.<sup>41</sup> A living wage is often proposed as part of a solution to preventing and reducing poverty and reducing income inequality for full-time workers who live below LICO. Using the before-tax LICO for 2012, Vibrant Communities Calgary calculates a living wage for this city as \$14.50 per hour without benefits.

Living wage campaigns gained momentum in the United Kingdom and the United States in the early 1990s. In the United Kingdom, living wage policies were first adopted by the Greater London authority (the city's municipal employer) for both municipal employers and outside contractors. Many other cities and hundreds of large companies in the United Kingdom have followed suit.<sup>42</sup> Likewise, over 130 municipalities in the U.S. have now adopted living wage policies, and some states have passed living wage legislation. In Canada, the movement appears to be gaining momentum in British Columbia, where at least two municipalities adopted a living wage for their workers and contractors in the past few years.<sup>43</sup> The City of Calgary rejected a living wage policy in 2009.<sup>44</sup> Research indicates the outcomes of living wage laws in the U.S. have been both positive and negative, resulting in increased wages among low-income workers with concomitant benefits in their lives, but reducing employment among the leastskilled workers they are intended to help. Research on the net effects is mixed, often depending on the data and methods used, with some studies identifying modest reductions in poverty rates<sup>45</sup> and others identifying no changes (for a good review of the research see <sup>46</sup>).

### 3.2.2. Educational upgrading

Low levels of education are a primary cause of low income across at-risk groups. Higher education reduces the risk of unemployment and of receiving too-few hours of employment.<sup>47</sup> Earnings generally rise in tandem with each successive level of higher education.<sup>48</sup> These trends are likely to continue. The Government of Alberta reports that between 2011 and 2015, approximately 62 per cent of new jobs in Alberta are expected to require some form of post-secondary education and there will be strong demand for workers with university degrees.47 Higher education is also associated with multiple measures of good health, along with longevity, meaning a higher likelihood of labour force participation and duration.49 Community and civic engagement (voting, charitable giving, volunteering, membership in community organizations, non-voting political activity),<sup>50-52</sup> and positive family functioning,<sup>53</sup> both of which prevent social exclusion in the short and longer terms, also increase with higher education.

As discussed earlier, well-paid jobs usually require higher education and, at minimum, a high school diploma. High school dropout rates in Calgary and in Alberta are among the highest in the country, especially for Aboriginal people<sup>2,54</sup> and some ESL students.<sup>55-58</sup> (Note that Alberta Education reports much higher completion rates among ESL students. However, Alberta Education tracked high school completion only among a small sample of students who were coded as ESL in the elementary grades and those who were coded in junior or senior high school but attended elementary school in Calgary. ESL students who entered the public school system at the junior or senior high school level and who might be expected to encounter the most difficulty in school were not tracked.)59 Fortunately, most of the youth who drop out pursue secondchance education opportunities in early adulthood. In 2010, by age 24, 89 per cent of Albertans had obtained a high school diploma or certificate or a GED.<sup>60</sup> In addition, a large, longitudinal study found, by ages 26 through 28, one-third of those Albertans who returned to school and obtained a diploma had carried on and participated in some form of post-secondary education.61

The challenge in preventing social exclusion among those who do not return to school on their own is in supporting them to develop their life skills and personal capacity to the point where it would be possible for them to complete high school or a GED. Reasons for dropping out of high school include a range of inter-related factors. These include, but are not limited to:

- · Learning and/or other disabilities
- Attitudes and values
- Substance abuse
- Conflict with the law
- Early parenting
- Disengagement from school that began in early childhood and resulted in a host of life challenges in adulthood

Evidence from the U.S. indicates the GED has less impact on employment and earnings than a high school diploma (for example, see <sup>62</sup>). However, even if GED recipients do not achieve outcomes equivalent to those of high school graduates, they may fare better than dropouts who do not obtain the credential. For example, they may experience greater life satisfaction, lower levels of depression and less substance abuse (for example, see <sup>62</sup>).

It is not entirely clear what sorts of programming help socially-excluded adults to complete high school or a GED because most programs have never been formally evaluated for effectiveness.<sup>63</sup> Practical barriers to GED completion include:

- Job responsibilities
- Home responsibility
- Transportation problems
- · Insufficient time to study
- Trouble with the law
- No babysitter
- Illness
- Pregnancy<sup>64</sup>

The reasons those pursuing or interested in pursuing a GED dropped out of high school in the first place may also play a role, such as doing poorly in high school or being disengaged from learning (for example, see <sup>65-66</sup>). Some adult learners face more serious personal challenges. For example, a recent study of participants aged 16 to 24 years in Quebec's adult education centres (AECs) found that 13 per cent had histories of past trauma and were dealing with major internalizing problems, such as psychological distress and suicidal ideation. An additional 12 per cent manifested high levels of delinquency, aggressive behaviour, and psychological distress, including suicidal ideation. The researchers concluded such youth "demonstrated a need for support that goes beyond the academic and school services usually offered in AECs."<sup>67</sup>

Some types of programming may help socially excluded individuals to move closer to education (and/or employment) readiness. These include:

## Education-employment bridging programs

In the U.S., bridging, sectoral training, and career ladder programs involving community colleges show promise for improving the employment prospects of socially excluded people. In bridging programs, training is linked to the demand in the labour market. Workers are screened for particular jobs and provided with remedial training to fit the job as required.<sup>68</sup> Career pathways programs are a type of bridging program in which high school and college students are trained for and progress into skilled jobs in particular industries based on education, training and work experience. Qualitative evaluation of Washington State's Integrated Basic Education and Skills Training (I-BEST) model showed that the program increased the rate at which basic skills students advanced to, and succeeded in, college-level occupational programs.<sup>69</sup>

#### Adult literacy programs

In this report, literacy is narrowly defined, as in the International Adult Literacy Survey (IALS),<sup>70</sup> as follows:

• Prose literacy (the knowledge and skills needed to understand and use information from texts, including editorials, news stories, poems and fiction).

- Document literacy (the knowledge and skills required to locate and use information contained in various formats like tables, graphs, schedules, charts, forms and maps).
- Quantitative literacy, or "numeracy," the knowledge and skills required to apply arithmetic operations to numbers embedded in printed materials (such as balancing a cheque-book, figuring out a tip or completing an order form, for example).

Literacy scores correlate with employment earnings. Statistics Canada reports that, controlling for education and labour market experience, a 10 point increase in literacy skills on the IALS scales would lead to a 3.1 per cent increase in earnings. Educational attainment has a much larger impact on literacy than work experience; in fact, general labour market experience has little net effect on literacy.<sup>71</sup> "Among high school dropouts, who tend to have much lower functional literacy scores than their graduate counterparts, enhanced literacy and numeracy skills can significantly improve labour market outcomes — independently of the impact of formal education. Indeed, in some cases, the effects of functional literacy appear to be substantially greater than the effects of the number of years of education."72

Efforts to improve the literacy skills of lowliterate adults have been "hampered by the relative dearth of research data on struggling adult learners and effective intervention approaches, the contextual challenges of delivering intensive interventions, limited personal and systemic resources, and competing demands on learners' time."73 What little research has been completed suggests that most adult literacy programs (i) do not significantly improve literacy or numeracy skills, although the learners often believe they do, and (ii) often improve participants' self-confidence and self-esteem, which may have spin-off benefits. There has been insufficient research, however, to draw firm conclusions (for example, see 74-78). Some research indicates the lack of impact on adult learners is due to the insufficient "dose" of instruction most programs provide. This is partly because some programs are not explicit, intensive, and systematic in their instruction, and partly because attendance in such programs is often sporadic. In

addition, some learners may not have the underlying cognitive processing abilities to benefit from instruction.<sup>74</sup> However, some researchers conclude "[f]or those adults who have the cognitive potential, a learning strategy may indeed be a valuable compensating strategy that provides a means to reading and learning if delivered in sufficient dosage and in settings that work with adult lifestyles."<sup>74</sup>

## Additional considerations for adult ESL learners

Best practices in adult ESL instruction are beyond the scope of the current discussion. Briefly, effective programs and methods of instruction for adult ESL students who are literate in their native languages have been identified. However, what works best with students who lack literacy skills in their home language is not clear, as the research on this issue consists primarily of descriptive studies.

## Additional considerations for people with disabilities

Research on education for adults with disabilities has typically taken the approach that learners with disabilities have unique or special needs that can be programmatically addressed by providing educational accommodations, such as assistive technologies, sign language interpretation, extended time for exams and so on (for example, see <sup>79</sup>). Clark, among others, has stressed that "each disability has learning issues that are inherently different and require individualized instructional strategies, techniques, and teaching approaches."<sup>80</sup>

Although discussion of adult education for people with disabilities is beyond the scope of this paper, Clark's observations apply to adult education in the form of literacy programs, along with employment programs (discussed below) which are often provided by community-based non-profit organizations. In short, the most effective types of programs and practices should be expected to vary among age groups and by types of disabilities. That being said, this is one area in which high-quality evaluation appears to be lacking. Myriad program descriptions exist, but evidence-based guidelines – even promising practices – appear to be non-existent.

## Adult employment programs and strategies

The few programs that have been subject to rigorous evaluation, such as Career Academies and Job Start in the U.S., are large, comprehensive, and long term. They target youth and young adults usually up to the age of 24 or 25 years. Most of these programs have been found to have limited impact on participants as a whole, but some have had strong and enduring positive impacts on the personal capacity and life skills of the most at-risk participants.<sup>81</sup>

Welfare-to-work programs in the U.S. have a dismal record, with extensive research showing most people find or keep jobs for a while, but few remain steadily employed, advance in the labour market, or earn a living wage (for example, see <sup>82-85</sup>).

Welfare recipients and people who experience frequent unemployment generally have low levels of education, low literacy rates, lack work experience, lack knowledge about workplace norms (e.g., lateness and absenteeism), and have few job skills. They may also experience additional barriers to work, including:

- Substance abuse and addictions
- Low cognitive functioning
- Mental health problems (especially depression)
- · Perceived discrimination at previous jobs
- Physical health problems or a child with health problems
- Criminal record
- Domestic violence
- Child care problems
- Transportation problems (for example, see <sup>30, 86-88</sup>)

For example, in a small Calgary study of employment difficulties experienced by the homeless, personal issues with drugs and problematic personal relationships were identified as reasons for work performance and availability problems.<sup>89</sup>

Among people experiencing one or more of these challenges, cycling between shortterm and part-time jobs and social assistance is common (for example, see <sup>90,91</sup>). Families where the chief breadwinner is sporadically employed in low-quality jobs are chronically on the brink of crisis: "With few options and without a margin of reserve resources, family capacity to weather difficulties and maintain health and well-being is tenuous at best."<sup>31</sup>

Given the negative outcomes for people forced off welfare and into work in the U.S., the federal government launched the Employment Advancement and Retention project in 1999. The goal was to test 16 different program models intended to help low-income people improve their employment and earnings. Program models included those which:

- Encouraged seeking a job in a preferred career over quick placement in any job.
- Provided job coaching before and during employment.
- Provided support services on the job site.
- Provided earnings supplements.
- Allowed flexibility in work requirements to promote participation in further education and training.
- Provided individualized retention and advancement services.
- Used inter-agency partnerships to leverage expertise, services, networks and resources.
- Sought out and served former welfare recipients.

MDRC was engaged to complete quasiexperimental, longitudinal evaluations of each program model. Summarizing the evaluations of the 12 individual projects that *did not* target "hard-to-employ" individuals, MRDC reported none of the demonstration projects had large effects, and only three had any effects. In brief, the findings were as follows:

- By themselves, counselling and referrals to help people stay employed do not appear to increase employment retention and advancement.
- Earnings supplements to make work financially worthwhile, tied to job retention, ideally coupled with job coaching and case management, can sometimes be effective.
   As evidenced by Canada's ground-breaking Self-Sufficiency Project, the beneficial effects on income of short-term (in this case, multi-year) earnings supplements

were not sustained,<sup>92</sup> although some participants benefitted in other ways.<sup>93</sup> However, in Texas' ERA program, in which earnings supplements were also provided, participants retained their jobs well after the supplements were discontinued.<sup>94</sup>

Other research has found that, although the effects are often quite limited, training programs for disadvantaged workers are more effective if they: (i) are voluntary, and (ii) do not target "hard-to-employ" individuals with severe disabilities or personal barriers such as criminal records, substance abuse issues, or very poor skills, are intense (many hours, often over several years), and include on-the-job training and work experience.<sup>68</sup>

## Additional considerations for recent immigrants

Program descriptions reveal job preparation and placement programs for recent immigrants generally include assistance with job search, resume development, interviewing skills and, in some programs, direct connections to employers, workplace skills, language training, occupational mentoring and networking, and skills credentialing. However, there appear to be no high-quality evaluations of such programs in Canada or the U.S. that assess the employment outcomes of program participants. The only available research, which is from Sweden, indicates intensive counselling and coaching significantly increases the employment prospects of new immigrants.95

Although the authors do not identify the evidence base for their work, in a recent Canadian policy paper,<sup>96</sup> Alboim and McIsaac delineate promising practices for programs to improve immigrants' employment,<sup>96</sup> as follows:

- Work experience programs that directly involve employers, e.g., internship programs, programs that subsidize wages.
- Social capital obtained via job mentoring in the field in which the individual is trained.
- Language training to improve communication skills and occupationspecific language skills for the workplace.

- Bridging programs in which employers, occupational regulatory bodies, and educational institutions work together to assess immigrants' skills and competencies, deliver training, and provide workplace experience with a view to avoiding duplication of immigrants' foreign training.
- Providing employers with the information and tools required to improve their human resources practices as they relate to skilled immigrants.
- Coordinating municipal and regional polices to develop and deliver local strategies for the economic integration of skilled immigrants and to align initiatives with labour market needs.

## Additional considerations for hard-to-employ parents

For the most part, the research on employment programs and strategies for low-income adults applies to parents. In fact, much of it is specific to hard-to-employ parents, especially single mothers. However, two-generational programs merit mention here.

In the U.S., the Enhanced Services for the Hard-to-Employ Demonstration and **Evaluation Project introduced demonstration** projects to improve employment among several hard-to-employ populations including low-income, multi-barriered parents. Earlier research had indicated that two-generational programs focusing both on parents' employment and economic self-sufficiency and child development, showed promise on both fronts.<sup>97</sup> In the demonstration project, two strong Early Head Start programs were enhanced with the addition of formalized employment and self-sufficiency curricula and services. Unfortunately, both sites experienced serious implementation challenges, did not provide services with sufficient intensity for most families, and had no impact on parental employment, parenting practices, or child development overall. However, it did help a sub-group of parents. At 42 months follow-up, parental employment and economic outcomes (although not parenting behaviours or child development) had significantly improved for families who were expecting a child or who had an infant (a child younger than 12 months old) when they first entered the study.98

#### Additional considerations for people with intellectual disabilities

As summarized by Trembath, et al., the benefits of employment for people with intellectual disabilities, as for people without disabilities, "include greater autonomy and financial freedom, increased self-esteem and emotional well-being, and improved quality of life. Employment also confers social status and leads to increased social networks, both within and outside the workplace."<sup>99</sup>

Among people with intellectual disabilities, successful employment is associated with extensive counselling, job placement, on-the-job support, maintenance, and other services (for example, see <sup>100</sup>). Research on the effectiveness of programs to assist people with intellectual disabilities to obtain and maintain employment has reported mixed results. This is partly due to two factors:

- 1. The selection bias (in this case, programs accepting participants with attributes associated with higher employability (such as higher IQ and lower incidence of emotional and behavioural problems<sup>101</sup>).<sup>102,103</sup>
- 2. To a lack of rigour in much of the evaluation literature.

One large American study, however, which controlled for selection bias, job retention, and job quality, found supported employment programs using job coaches increased the probability of participants being employed in a job paying a reasonable wage by at least 1.5 times.<sup>102</sup>

This study<sup>102</sup> identified the components of effective programs to include:

- Assessing skills and developing a plan for achieving competitive employment.
- Identifying a job suitable for the individual.
- Placement and job-site training for at least six months.
- Follow up and coaching for at least six months.

At least two studies have reported that, while it may have many other benefits, volunteering does not appear to work as a stepping stone to paid employment for people with intellectual disabilities. However, work experience, undertaken as part of a dedicated employment program, may improve employment prospects.<sup>99,104</sup>

## Additional considerations for seniors

The employment rate among seniors has increased since around the year 2000. This trend is likely to continue due to improved health among seniors, fewer adults with defined benefit pensions, and less generous pensions in general.<sup>105,106</sup> The impacts of the economic downturn and other factors, including spending and saving habits,<sup>107</sup> on the savings of Canadians in their pre-retirement years<sup>108</sup> also contribute to this trend.

In 2012, 12 per cent of the Canadian population aged 65 years and over were employed in some capacity.<sup>109</sup> However, there is good evidence that seniors who would most benefit from income from employment are the least likely - and the least able - to continue to work or return to work after the age of 65. Data from the 2009 Canadian Community Health Survey (CCHS) Healthy Aging show that about 10 per cent of Canadians aged 65 to 74 years were still working for pay in a fullor part-time capacity, with participation rates declining with age.<sup>110</sup> Financially-secure and well-educated workers were more likely to remain employed than those who retired.<sup>110</sup> In fact, fully retired people aged 55 years and over were far more likely to be living on low or moderate incomes, to have very little wealth in savings or investments, and to experience multiple, chronic health conditions than those who continued to work.110

Among men and women aged 55 years and over who had retired, less than three per cent (three quarters of them under the age of 65 years) returned to work (including self-employment), 72 per cent on a part-time basis. Almost two-thirds of the returnees had post-secondary degrees and held white-collar jobs. Half identified financial considerations among their reasons for returning to work; half reported they liked to work or wanted to be active.<sup>110</sup>

As identified by the National Seniors Council, barriers to working experienced by seniors, in addition to poor health, include:

- Poorly adapted physical work environments.
- Informal caregiving responsibilities.

- Mandatory retirement practices.
- Misperceptions and negative attitudes towards older workers (ageism).
- Outdated and inflexible human resource practices.
- Lack of awareness of available job opportunities and working options.
- Lack of appropriate skills, education and access to training needed to update skills or transition to a new job.
- Low job satisfaction.<sup>111</sup>

In its comprehensive *Report on the Labour Force Participation of Seniors and Near Seniors, and Intergenerational Relations,* the National Seniors Council identifies many policy and program initiatives that have been, and could be, undertaken by governments, primarily the federal government, to address these barriers to workforce participation among seniors.<sup>111</sup> The federal government's employment-related programs and supports for older workers, such as the Targeted Initiative for Older Workers, in fact target adults aged 55 to 64 years.<sup>112</sup> No best or promising practices in employment or retraining programs or supports for seniors were found in the research.

#### Community-based employment: A promising idea

In Cape Breton, the experimental **Community Employment Innovation** Program (CEIP) was a non-profit initiative funded by the federal and provincial governments. The CEIP ran from 1999-2005 in six Cape Breton communities to test an active re-employment strategy for unemployed individuals who volunteered to work on locally developed community projects in areas hit by chronic unemployment. In exchange for foregoing their Employment Insurance or welfare benefits, CEIP offered participants wages to work on community projects for up to three years, giving them a significant period of stable income as well as an opportunity to gain work experience, acquire new skills, and expand their network of contacts. In effect, the project provided communities with subsidized labour that could be put to productive use in fulfilling local needs. Communities were responsible for creating decision-making bodies and mobilizing

project sponsors to develop projects that responded to these local needs.<sup>113-115</sup>

Quasi-experimental evaluations of the CEIP by SRDC found mixed results:<sup>113-115</sup>

- During the project, participants realized large improvements in their employment and earnings, increased their household income, reduced their level of poverty and improved their well-being. However, these effects were not sustained after the program ended.
- The experience participants received through CEIP helped many move into better quality jobs after the program. Even though their earning did not increase, they were more satisfied with the work. Many also maintained the improvements in their social networks as well as their transferable skills and attitudes toward work after leaving the project.
- Participants who were previously on welfare experienced sustained reductions in their receipt of income assistance long after the project had ended.

This project does not appear to have been replicated.

### 3.3 Diverse social networks

While social capital is not as important as human capital (education, skills, work experience), personal networks are associated with the ability to find and maintain employment and with higher annual income. Research has found that people living on low incomes, including welfare recipients, actually made more use of their personal networks than non-recipients, especially friends, neighbours, social services, and health professionals. However, merely having social connections was not enough. For many welfare recipients, their social support connections were in much the same position as they were, and unable to provide useful links or help other than moral support. In other words, friends and family may be concerned about the individual's well-being, but their capacity to help may be limited, hence the need for bridging social capital and social support to improve economic well-being.116-118

Likewise, research has demonstrated that among immigrants, social ties with

members of one's own ethnocultural group are often associated with higher chances of employment (for example, see <sup>119,120</sup>). In some studies, "within group" ties have been associated with advancement in the labour market. In others, such ties have been associated primarily with low-skilled and low-paid jobs.<sup>121</sup>

However, data from Canada's 2008 General Social Survey indicate what matters for both the Canadian-born population and immigrants is the *diversity* of one's personal network, particularly contacts in a wide range of occupations. Network size, frequency of contact with friends and relatives, and strength or closeness of personal ties do not increase the probability of being employed or having higher income. In fact, having a higher proportion of close contacts actually seems to be linked with lower chances of having a job.<sup>122</sup> Lower occupational diversity of social networks has been identified by Statistics Canada as one factor contributing to lower employment

rates among recent immigrants.<sup>122</sup> The finding that diversified social networks are associated with higher employment probability in Canada is not new. It is also consistent with Canadian and other research suggesting that an ethnically diverse social network, including native-born members of society and established immigrants, increases the probability of employment among immigrants.<sup>123-127</sup>

As discussed below, employment preparation programs for newcomers that include opportunities to build professional networks and professional mentoring may be more effective than those in which the focus is on gaining Canadian work experience alone.

### 3.4 Asset building

Many low-income households have few significant assets, such as a home or savings for retirement, children's education, or even emergencies. It is widely agreed that, at the very minimum, households should have sufficient savings to get by for three months without other support if their incomes were to end (for example, see <sup>128</sup>). Lack of assets translates into difficulty meeting basics needs, shortfalls that delay retirement and vulnerability to predatory lenders. Conversely, "with an asset cushion, families can enter into a virtuous circle of asset accumulation — paying down debts, saving more, earning a credit rating, and, as but one example, [being able to] afford a down payment on a home ... Homeownership and a good education can be springboards into the middle class and better child outcomes. As for shorter-term benefits, home or retirement savings can provide families with leverage to borrow during emergencies by tapping into home equity lines of credit or retirement funds. Asset-holding and the increased job stability that goes hand in hand with a better education can boost credit ratings, which in turn can open up additional options for borrowing in an emergency and at lower interest rates."129

In Canada, the federal government has traditionally encouraged asset building through tax measures, such as registered retirement savings plans (RRSPs) and the new Tax-Free Savings Account (TFSA) to shelter some saved income, along with the Registered Education Savings Plan (RESP). However, such programs target people with disposable income, usually middle- and upper-income consumers, and have little appeal to low-income people.

#### **Financial literacy training**

Financial capability is a precondition for saving money and material assets, which allows for planning, saving, and investing for a better future. There is "widespread agreement among the research community that individuals with lower levels of financial literacy are at increased risk for behaviours that may lead to a personal financial crisis and for financial victimization by predatory lenders," such as pay day loan services.<sup>130</sup> Low financial literacy is also linked with under-subscription to public programs and benefits, such as the Guaranteed Income Supplement, and with not having a bank account.

Research on the effectiveness of financial literacy programs to increase savings and use of financial products among low-income individuals has produced mixed findings. This is partly due to wide variations in program content and structure and to selfselection bias,<sup>131</sup> i.e., those who participate may be more motivated to improve their financial management skills. For example, what appears to be the only experimental evaluation of a full-fledged program (a program to increase on-line banking), found the program had no impact and few positive effects on other behaviours.<sup>132</sup> On the other hand, early findings from a non-experimental evaluation of a program for low-income and ethno-racial minority adults that provide financial literacy training using video games indicated a significant increase in self-confidence and knowledge associated with financial skills.<sup>133</sup> In addition, evaluations of some financial literacy programs for high-risk mortgage applicants in the U.S. have reported lower mortgage default rates.134,135

A recent review of research on financial literacy and related programs in Canada suggests that financial literacy initiatives may help participants to access government benefits, such as tax credits, tax refunds and the Canada Learning Bond.<sup>135</sup> This review also identifies four promising practices in the content and delivery of financial literacy programs:

- 1. Offer appropriate, accurate content tailored to the audience, with content specifically tailored for newcomers, residents of high-poverty neighbourhoods, the homeless and insecurely housed, and youth.
- 2. Ensure the program is delivered by trusted persons (not necessarily representatives of financial institutions) who are non-judgemental and understand the participants' circumstances.
- 3. Ensure programs are delivered by stable organizations or are embedded in programs with the capacity to be sustained.

- 4. Ensure programs are consistent with principles of adult learning for adult clients. That is to say:
  - a. Participants self-select and learn when they are motivated to do so.
  - b. Filter and selectively attend to information they feel is relevant to them.
  - c. Learn best by doing.
  - d. Respond to guidance, not instructions.
  - e. Have independent ideas and experience they bring to their learning.

## Individual development accounts

Individual development accounts (IDAs) are a key asset-building strategy that allows individuals living in poverty to gain greater financial independence. As described by Social and Economic Development Innovations (SEDI), IDAs are "savings accounts to help low-income persons build assets by matching each dollar they save with a savings credit, at a set ratio and for a set period of time. For example, if an account holder saves \$1 and is matched at 3:1, that \$1 becomes \$4. By matching each dollar saved, IDAs provide low-income families and individuals with an opportunity and an incentive to acquire savings that they may otherwise be unable to accumulate."137

Matched savings in an IDA program are targeted for specific uses, such as continuing education, employment training, tools for work, small business creation, or home ownership, which enhance a participant's personal assets. In many IDA programs that target youth, the matched savings are used for post-secondary education or training. Another important IDA program component is that matched savings are never provided directly to the participant, but are paid to a third-party vendor. For example, if a participant elects to use his savings for education, the matched contribution is paid directly to the educational institution. Most IDA programs include training in financial "capability" or "literacy" for participants. IDAs also provide an alternative to traditional incentives to save and invest for the future.

IDAs are still somewhat new in Canada, but they are becoming increasingly common in the United Kingdom and United States as the social and economic effects of asset accumulation become increasingly clear. The final, experimentally-designed evaluation of *learn\$ave*,<sup>138-141</sup> an IDA research and demonstration project sponsored by Human Resources and Skills Development Canada, reveals some positive outcomes:

- Participants overall saved a mean of \$959 over three years; participants receiving income assistance saved a mean of \$553.
- Two-thirds of participants saved the \$1,500 maximum and received matched credits; 11 per cent saved \$120 or less and were not eligible for matches; one-quarter had some savings and earned matched credits but less than the maximum.
- "Modest/unsuccessful savers" were more likely to be Canadian-born and to have lower levels of education at baseline but they were equally likely to fall into the lowest, middle and highest income ranges in the project. The most successful savers were recent immigrants and those with a higher level of education.<sup>138</sup>

Participants who received financial management training and enhanced case management services saved only somewhat more than those who did not receive supplementary services, leading researchers to conclude that there was no major benefit to adding these services on top of the matched credits in an IDA account.<sup>138</sup>

#### Improved access to mainstream financial services and micro-loans

It is estimated as many as 15 per cent of lowincome individuals do not have an account with a bank or credit union. They rely instead on cheque-cashing stores, payday lenders, and rent-to-own stores,<sup>142</sup> which typically charge exorbitant fees and interest rates. According to Statistics Canada, "when annualized, interest rates and other fees charged for borrowing \$100 for 14 days can range from 335 per cent to 650 per cent rates that exceed the criminal interest provisions of the Criminal Code."<sup>143</sup> Analysis of data from the 2005 Survey of Financial Security revealed almost half of families who used payday loans reported they had no one to turn to for financial assistance in the face of financial difficulty. The data also showed that borrowing from payday loan companies can trigger a spiral of debt and poor financial decision-making.<sup>143</sup>

Barriers to using mainstream financial institutions include identification requirements, cheque hold policies, garnishment and set-off, location and hours of operation. Many of these barriers require policy solutions, but community-based programming and community development initiatives can make an immediate difference by assisting people to obtain identification, assisting with debt repayment programs, assisting people to access the government benefit programs to which they are entitled, providing financial literacy training, and establishing community loan funds and other micro-loan programs.

In Canada, micro-finance programs generally offer small loans, loan guarantees, or equity investments to people with no collateral and, often, a spotty credit history, usually for the purpose of starting a business. Programs are sometimes provided by financial institutions, although many not-for-profit organizations offer their own low-interest or no-interest micro-loan initiatives.<sup>123</sup> The greatest challenge for community-based micro-loan programs is that, primarily because of their interest rate practices, they don't generally return a profit and rely instead on private donations and/or government grants to stay in business.<sup>144</sup>

Although there appears to be no evidence-based evaluations of micro-finance or micro-lending programs in terms of their effectiveness in helping low-income people attain self-sufficiency, some American "soft" evaluations have been very positive. For example, a 2008 survey of 878 microenterprise program clients revealed almost 60 per cent of the 18 per cent of clients who were living in poverty when they started the program, had moved out of poverty one year later.<sup>145</sup> Evaluation of the U.S. Microenterprise Welfare to Work Demonstration found that two years after intake, 25 per cent of participants who completed a survey were self-employed, 31 per cent were employed by others, and 12 per cent were both working and operating a business. In addition, the percent of respondents who were receiving welfare benefits declined from 94 per cent to 25 per cent.<sup>146</sup>

Likewise, outcome evaluation of the Community Micro-Loan Program of Alterna Savings Credit Union in Toronto reported very positive outcomes. The program provides small-business loans of up to \$15,000 to individuals with strong business plans. Participants generally have a personal annual income of less than \$30,000. They are either newcomers to Canada, are on some form of government assistance, or both. To qualify for the Alterna program, clients' loan requests must have been rejected by other financial institutions because of low credit scores or insufficient collateral. Between 2000 and 2009, Alterna loaned over \$1.5 million to some 340 borrowers in the Greater Toronto Area. During the program's first ten years, the average default rate on Community Micro-Loans was 9.4 per cent. The evaluation found that 90 per cent of borrowers repaid their loan on time. Eighty-one per cent of borrowers increased their income, with one-third reporting increases of \$10,000 or more. Forty-one per cent reported the loan had improved their family's economic status in ways including financial stability, better nutrition, and the purchase of assets. In fact, home ownership increased from eight per cent to 27 per cent of borrowers. In addition, the percentage of borrowers who received some sort of government assistance declined from 41 per cent to 21 per cent.147

### 3.5 Reducing expenses

Either in conjunction with, or as an alternative to, strategies to increase income, initiatives to reduce household expenses may improve individuals' and families' economic self-sufficiency. Evidence-based research on such initiatives is lacking. The following section describes some of the initiatives that offer promise in increasing self-sufficiency.

#### Housing

A number of studies have explored whether housing subsidies have an effect on the economic self-sufficiency of a household, with mixed findings. A recent review of the research summarizes the evidence as follows: "Some studies report positive and statistically significant effects on improving self-sufficiency; others report insignificant or neutral effects. However, only a handful of these studies use valid measures of housing assistance and results from these studies are generally similar: Receipt of housing assistance is associated with a short-term decline in earnings and work, but this decline becomes insignificant after about two years. Those who receive housing assistance are more likely to also receive higher welfare amounts, compared with non-recipients of housing assistance and this association persists over time. Other studies suggest public housing, combined with services, has positive effects, and two studies found public housing may lead to beneficial educational outcomes for children."148-151

In Canada, some research has found that among low-income families, the proportion of income allocated to housing is inversely associated with food expenditures, i.e., the amount spent on food decreases as the amount spent on housing increases.<sup>152,153</sup>

#### Transportation

Many low-income individuals and families face transportation challenges. These people, many of whom do not own cars, often cannot find suitable transportation to and from home, work, child care, and other destinations. Subsidized transit passes, such as those provided through The City of Calgary's recently expanded low-income monthly transit pass program, can help address the cost of public transit, which taxes the budgets of many individuals and families. However, public transportation may not be adequate in some communities. Similarly, the hours of transit operation in a city like Calgary may be insufficient for people working in low-skill jobs, many of which are located in industrial areas far from lower-income urban neighbourhoods. This spatial mismatch means it can be impossible for workers using public transit to get to work on time, or to get home safely at the end of a work day. Recent American research, focusing on cities featuring urban sprawl, has documented a positive relationship between employment and reliable transportation, in this case a vehicle, but the findings may reasonably be inferred to include all forms of transportation.154,155

The City of Calgary has taken steps to meet the transportation needs of low-income and mobility-challenged citizens through policies and programs including the recently expanded low-income monthly transit pass, accessible C-Train stations, low floor buses, and accessible transportation in partnership with Calgary Handi-bus and private taxi companies. No recent research on the extent to which these services meet the needs of those who require them appears to be publicly available.

#### Food security initiatives

The World Food Summit of 1996 defined food security as existing "when all people at all times have access to sufficient, safe, nutritious food to maintain a healthy and active life."<sup>156</sup> Unfortunately, research shows that food insecurity is quite widespread among low-income people in Canada. The available evidence suggests "that income affects food intake both directly and indirectly through the dispositions associated with particular social class locations."<sup>157</sup> Food insecurity has been associated with obesity, behaviour problems, learning difficulties, stunted growth, and other developmental problems among children and youth,<sup>158-162</sup> and depression and anxiety among low-income mothers.<sup>163,164</sup> At least one large Canadian study has identified school food programs as a way of reducing the intergenerational transmission of social inequalities. In Quebec, a school food program for adolescents reduced or eliminated the higher risk among low-income students of school activity limitations, below-average grades, repeating a grade and poor academic performance.<sup>165</sup>

Some American research indicates food security programs strengthen household food security among low-income families. For example, a large study of school breakfast programs in the U.S. found that, in addition to providing meals to children who might otherwise forego them, the programs improved food security by freeing up household resources to feed other family members and by reducing the uncertainty surrounding availability of sufficient food. The programs were not sufficient to improve food security in high poverty households with high levels of food insecurity, i.e., once hardship had crossed a certain threshold.<sup>166</sup>

Likewise, Canadian qualitative research indicates community or collective kitchens, where a group of people come together to pool their resources and labour to produce large quantities of food they take home, are a particular kind of food security initiative, and may offer some economic benefits in addition to increasing healthy eating.<sup>167-169</sup> For example, participants in a study of collective kitchens in three Canadian cities reported some increases in their food resources as a result of participation.<sup>170</sup>

#### 2020 update

The table below is organized alphabetically by type of intervention. There is some overlap in the types of interventions included in each category. The links provide access to full-text resources as they are available. The table is a curated list of resources, it is not a comprehensive catalogue of all research in each area. The table includes two types of resources, (1) Best Practice Reviews/Clearing Houses, and (2) more detailed information on specific interventions.

## Best practice reviews and clearing houses

Best Practice Reviews provide high-level program-overviews and concise summaries of program research/evaluation. Many rate or rank programs using high-level categories like "model plus/model/promising." There are also links to Clearing Houses, these sites provide examples of programs that have a strong or promising evidence base. To be included here, organizations that produce the best-practice review have to operate independently from private interests and have a clearly articulated process and quality control.

#### **Detailed information**

While Best Practice Reviews/Clearing Houses are fairy high-level, resources in this section provide more detail. This includes best-practice guidelines and toolkits, which focus on program implementation, as well as several types of research summaries. These include literature reviews, which are narrative summaries of existing research on a

specific topic, and systematic reviews, which use more rigorous methods to collect and assess studies and synthesize findings. Metaanalysis is a type of statistical analysis often used in systematic reviews that combines the results of multiple similar scientific studies, in order to see if the overall effect is positive or negative. In some sections, examples of new programs with strong published evaluation results are included. Resources included in this section come from peer-reviewed journal articles as well as well-documented grey literature including government agencies, best practice sites, and systematic review organizations (e.g. Cochrane Library, Campbell Collaboration) published since 2013:

### What works by type of intervention

Type of intervention	Best practice reviews and detailed information
Affordable Housing	<b>Best practice reviews and clearing houses:</b> Canada's Social and Affordable Housing Landscape: A Province-to-Province Overview Ontario Supportive Housing Best Practice Guide <sup>171</sup> Promising Practices: 12 Case Studies in Supportive Housing for People with Mental Health and Addiction Issues <sup>172</sup>
	<b>Detailed information:</b> Australian Housing and Urban Research Institute - Research Library <sup>173</sup> BC Housing - Research Library <sup>174</sup> Campbell Collaboration Systematic Review - Effectiveness of Interventions to Reduce
	Homelessness <sup>175</sup> Evaluating the Housing First Approach in the Metro Vancouver Region <sup>176</sup>
Asset building, education, and financial inclusion programs	<b>Best practice reviews and clearing houses:</b> Social Programs That Work – H&R Block College Financial Aid Application Assistance <sup>177</sup> Social Programs That Work – Learning Accounts <sup>178</sup>
	What Works? Proven Approaches to Alleviating Poverty <sup>179</sup> <b>Detailed information:</b> Are We Failing Young People Not in Employment, Education or Training (NEETs)? A Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis of Reengagement Interventions <sup>180</sup>
	Campbell Collaboration Systematic Review – Impact of Financial Inclusion <sup>181</sup> Campbell Collaboration Systematic Review – Interventions to Improve the Labour Market Outcomes of Youth: A Systematic Review of Training, Entrepreneurship Promotion, Employment Services and Subsidized Employment Interventions <sup>182</sup>
	Evidence Base to Empower Low-Income and Vulnerable Families <sup>183</sup> The Social Research and Demonstration Corporation – Programs for Older Workers <sup>184</sup> The Social Research and Demonstration Corporation – Skills Training Programs <sup>185</sup>

Type of intervention	Best practice reviews and detailed information
Financial literacy programs	Best practice reviews and clearing houses:         A Review of Large-Scale Youth Financial Literacy Education Policies and Programs <sup>186</sup> Best Practices for Financial Literacy and Education <sup>187</sup> Detailed information:         Campbell Collaboration Systematic Review – Financial Education for HIV-Vulnerable Youth, Orphans and Vulnerable Children <sup>188</sup> Global Financial Literacy Excellence Center – Program Evaluations <sup>189</sup>
Financial self-sufficiency programs	Best practice reviews and clearing houses:         Inventory of Research on Economic Self-Sufficiency <sup>190</sup> Self-Sufficiency Research Clearinghouse <sup>191</sup> Social Programs That Work – Employment and Welfare <sup>192</sup> Detailed information:         Family Self Sufficiency Program – Program Model and Training <sup>193</sup> Programs and Strategies on Self-Sufficiency, Welfare, & Employment <sup>194</sup> The Social Research and Demonstration Corporation – Programs for Social Assistance Recipients <sup>195</sup>
Literacy and essential skills programs	Best practice reviews and clearing houses:         LitBase – Database of Effective Literacy and Numeracy Practices (UNESCO) <sup>196</sup> Detailed information:         Adult Literacy and Essential Skills Research Institute – Research and Program Summaries <sup>197</sup> Improving Adult Literacy Instruction: Options for Practice and Research <sup>198</sup>
Programs for immigrants	Detailed information:         Beyond Work: Reducing Social Isolation for Refugee Women and Other Marginalized Newcomers <sup>199</sup> Building New Skills: Immigration and Workforce Development in Canada <sup>200</sup> Campbell Collaboration Systematic Review – Interventions to Improve the Economic Self-sufficiency and Well-being of Resettled Refugees: A Systematic Review <sup>201</sup> The Social Research and Demonstration Corporation – New Immigrants <sup>202</sup>
Programs for people with disabilities	Detailed information:         Campbell Collaboration Systematic Review – Individualized Funding Interventions to Improve         Health and Social Care Outcomes for People with a Disability: A Mixed-Methods Systematic Review <sup>203</sup> Canadian Centre on Disability Studies – Project Summaries and Evaluations <sup>204</sup> Center for Employment and Disability Research – Project Summaries <sup>205</sup> Centre for Research on Work Disability Policy – Project Summaries and Evaluations <sup>206</sup> Inclusive Employment for Canadians with Disabilities: Toward a New Policy Framework and Agenda <sup>207</sup>
Social insurance programs	Detailed information: Social Insurance Programs – Evaluations <sup>208</sup>

#### In this document:

- "Evidence-based" means that a program or practice has been tested in a well-designed and methodologically sound experimental (randomized controlled trial (RCT)) or quasi-experimental study (and, ideally, multiple studies and replicated in more than one site), and has been shown to produce significant reductions in poor outcomes or associated risk factors or significant increases in positive outcomes or associated protective factors.
- "Best practices" refer to programs or components of programs or delivery methods that have been identified as effective (i.e., produce significant reductions in poor outcomes or associated risk factors or significant increases in positive outcomes or associated protective factors) by repeated methodologically sound studies using an experimental (RCT) or quasi-experimental design.
- "Promising practices" refer to programs or components of programs or delivery methods that have been identified as effective ("effective" as defined above) in at least one well-designed and methodologically sound study using at least a pre-post design with a large sample of participants that has been subject to peer review.
- "Prevention" means creating conditions or personal attributes that strengthen the healthy development, well-being, and safety of individuals across the lifespan and/or communities. Prevention programs deter the onset of a problem, intervene at a very early stage in its development or mitigate risk factors/strengthen protective factors. In the research-based risk and protection prevention paradigm, prevention occurs by reducing risk factors and increasing protective factors.
- Risk and protective factors A risk factor can be defined as a characteristic at the biological, psychological, family, community or cultural level that precedes and is associated with a higher likelihood of problem outcomes. Conversely, a protective factor can be defined as a characteristic at the biological, psychological, family, community or cultural level that is associated with a lower likelihood of problem outcomes or that reduces the negative impact of a risk factor.

### **Reference list**

- Persons in Low Income by Age, Sex and Economic Family Type. Government of Canada Statistics Canada; 2017. https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/t1/tbl1/en/tv.action?pid=1110018101. Accessed March 16, 2020.
- <sup>2</sup> 2006 Aboriginal Population Profiles for Selected Cities and Communities: Prairie Provinces. Statistics Canada; 2010. https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/n1/pub/89-638-x/89-638-x2010003-eng.htm. Accessed March 16, 2020.
- <sup>3</sup> From Coast to Coast: Provincial Rates of Low-Income among Canadians With and Without Disabilities | Council of Canadians with Disabilities. Council of Canadians with Disabilities. http://www.ccdonline.ca/en/socialpolicy/poverty-citizenship/demographic-profile/geography. Accessed March 16, 2020.
- <sup>4</sup> Indicators of Well-Being in Canada. Financial Security Low Income Incidence. Human Resources and Skills Development Canada http://www4.hrsdc.gc.ca/.3ndic.1t.4r@-eng.jsp?iid=23. Accessed December 1, 2012.
- <sup>5</sup> Burstein M. Combatting the Social Exclusion of At-Risk Groups. Ottawa, Ontario: Government of Canada, Policy Research Initiative; 2005.
- <sup>6</sup> *Federal Poverty Reduction Plan: Working in Partnership Towards Reducing Poverty In Canada.* Ottawa, Ontario: Standing Committee on Human Resources, Skills and Social Development and the Status of Persons with Disabilities; 2010.
- <sup>7</sup> Sen A. Social Exclusion: Concept, Application, and Scrutiny. Office of the Environment and Social Development Asian Development Bank; 2000. https://www.adb.org/sites/default/files/publication/29778/social-exclusion.pdf.
- <sup>8</sup> Holzer HJ, Schanzenbach DW, Duncan GJ, Ludwig J. *The Economic Costs of Poverty in the United States: Subsequent Effects of Children Growing Up Poor.* Center for American Progress; 2007. https://www.americanprogress.org/issues/poverty/reports/2007/01/24/2450/the-economic-costs-of-poverty/. Accessed March 16, 2020.
- <sup>9</sup> Wilkinson RG, Pickette K. The Spirit Level: Why Equality Is Better for Everyone. London, UK: Penguin Books; 2009.
- <sup>10</sup> Hoddinott J, Lethbridge L, Phipps S. Is History Destiny? Resources, Transitions and Child Education Attainments in Canada. Final Report. *Human Resources Development Canada*. 2002.
- <sup>11</sup> Grant R, Gracy D, Goldsmith G, Shapiro A, Redlener IE. Twenty-Five Years of Child and Family Homelessness: Where Are We Now? *Am J Public Health*. 2013;103(Suppl 2):e1-e10. doi:10.2105/AJPH.2013.301618
- <sup>12</sup> Canada's National Housing Strategy. Government of Canada; 2017:41. https://www.placetocallhome.ca/.
- <sup>13</sup> Government of Canada SC. Low income statistics by age, sex and economic family type, Table: 11-10-0135-01. https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/t1/tbl1/en/tv.action?pid=1110013501. Published February 26, 2019. Accessed April 8, 2020.
- <sup>14</sup> Table: 11-10-0134-01 Gini Coefficients of Adjusted Market, Total and after-Tax Income. Statistics Canada
- <sup>15</sup> Fox D, Moyser M. Women in Canada: A Gender-Based Statistical Report: The Economic Well-Being of Women in Canada. Statistics Canada; 2018. https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/n1/pub/89-503-x/2015001/article/54930-eng.htm. Accessed April 13, 2020.
- <sup>16</sup> Pelletier R, Patterson M, Moyser M. The Gender Wage Gap in Canada: 1998 to 2018. Statistics Canada, Labour Statistics Division; 2019. https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/n1/pub/75-004-m/75-004-m2019004-eng.htm#correction-notice. Accessed April 13, 2020.
- <sup>17</sup> Visible Minority (15), Individual Low-Income Status (6), Low-Income Indicators (4), Generation Status (4), Age (6) and Sex (3) for the Population in Private Households of Canada, Provinces and Territories, Census Metropolitan Areas and Census Agglomerations, 2016 Census – 25% Sample Data. Statistics Canada; 2017.
- <sup>18</sup> Immigrant Status and Period of Immigration (11), Individual Low-Income Status (6), Low-Income Indicators (4), Age (6) and Sex (3) for the Population in Private Households of Canada, Provinces and Territories, Census Metropolitan Areas and Census Agglomerations, 2016 Census – 25% Sample Data. Statistics Canada; 2017.
- <sup>19</sup> Canadian Income Inequality: Is Canada Becoming More Unequal? Conference Board of Canada https://www.conferenceboard.ca/hcp/hot-topics/caninequality.aspx. Accessed March 16, 2020.
- <sup>20</sup> Torjman S. Poverty Policy. Ottawa, Ont.: Caledon Institute of Social Policy; 2008. http://epe.lac-bac.gc.ca/100/200/300/caledon\_institute/ poverty\_policy/PovertyPolicyComplete.pdf. Accessed March 16, 2020.
- <sup>21</sup> Osberg L. Poverty Among Senior Citizens: A Canadian Success Story. Centre for the Study of Living Standards; 2001:151-181. https://econpapers.repec.org/bookchap/slssecfds/08.htm. Accessed March 16, 2020.
- <sup>22</sup> In from the Margins: A Call to Action on Poverty, Housing and Homelessness. Ottawa, Ontario: Senate of Canada, Standing Committee on Social Affairs, Science and Technology; 2009. https://sencanada.ca/content/sen/Committee/402/citi/rep/rep02dec09-e.pdf. Accessed March 16, 2020.
- <sup>23</sup> Evaluation of the Guaranteed Income Supplement. Employment and Social Development, Government of Canada; 2019.

- <sup>24</sup> Green D, Riddell C, St.Hilaire F. Income Inequality in Canada.; 2017. https://irpp.org/research-studies/income-inequality-in-canada/. Accessed April 13, 2020.
- <sup>25</sup> Canada's Poverty Reduction Strategy An Update. Employment and Social Development; 2019. https://www.canada.ca/en/employmentsocial-development/programs/results/poverty-reduction.html. Accessed April 13, 2020.
- <sup>26</sup> Towards a More Equal Canada: A Report on Canada's Economic and Social Inequality. Broadbent Institute; 2012. http://d3n8a8pro7vhmx. cloudfront.net/broadbent/legacy\_url/7023/towards\_a\_more\_equal\_canada.pdf?1430361451. Accessed March 16, 2020.
- <sup>27</sup> Young M, Mulvale JP, Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives, Economic Security Project. Possibilities and Prospects: The Debate over a Guaranteed Income. Ottawa, Ont.: Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives; 2009. http://ra.ocls.ca/ra/login.aspx?inst=centennial&url=https:// www.deslibris.ca/ID/220324. Accessed March 16, 2020.
- <sup>28</sup> Forget EL. The Town with No Poverty: The Health Effects of a Canadian Guaranteed Annual Income Field Experiment. *Canadian Public Policy*. 2011;37(3):283-305. doi:10.3138/cpp.37.3.283
- <sup>29</sup> Luong M. The wealth and finances of employed low-income families. *Perspectives on Labour and Income*. 2011;23(3). https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/n1/pub/75-001-x/2011003/article/11529-eng.htm.
- <sup>30</sup> Acs G, Loprest P. TANF Caseload Composition and Leavers Synthesis Report. The Urban Institute; 2007. https://www.acf.hhs.gov/sites/default/ files/opre/tanf\_caseload\_final.pdf.
- <sup>31</sup> Hildebrandt E, Stevens P. Impoverished Women With Children and No Welfare Benefits: The Urgency of Researching Failures of the Temporary Assistance for Needy Families Program. *Am J Public Health*. 2009;99(5):793-801. doi:10.2105/AJPH.2006.106211
- <sup>32</sup> Saunders R. Lifting the Boats: Policies to Make Work Pay. Ottawa, Ontario: Canadian Policy Research Networks; 2005.
- <sup>33</sup> Cranford CJ, Vosko LF, Zukewich N. Precarious Employment in the Canadian Labour Market: A Statistical Portrait. *JL*. December 1969. doi:10.25071/1705-1436.164
- <sup>34</sup> Vallée G. Towards Enhancing the Employment Conditions of Vulnerable Workers: A Public Policy Perspective. Ottawa, Ontario: Canadian Policy Research Networks; 2005:71. http://cprn3.library.carleton.ca/documents/35588\_en.pdf. Accessed March 16, 2020.
- <sup>35</sup> Marshall K. Benefits of the job. *Perspectives on Labour and Income*. 2003;4(5). https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/n1/pub/75-001-x/00503/6515eng.html. Accessed March 16, 2020.
- <sup>36</sup> Vosko L, Zukewich, N, Cranford C. Precarious jobs: A new typology of employment. *Perspectives on Labour and Income*. 4(10). https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/n1/pub/75-001-x/01003/6642-eng.html. Accessed March 16, 2020.
- <sup>37</sup> Adelman L, Middleton S, Ashworth K. Employment, Poverty and Social Exclusion: Evidence from the Poverty and Social Exclusion Survey of Britain. Centre for Research in Social Policy; 1999:78.
- <sup>38</sup> Atkinson AB, Hills J. *Exclusion, Employment and Opportunity.* Suntory and Toyota International Centres for Economics and Related Disciplines; Centre for Analysis of Social Exclusion; 1998. https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract\_id=1158895. Accessed March 16, 2020.
- <sup>39</sup> Fortin M. How (un)healthy are poor working-age Canadians? *Policy Options*. 29(8). https://policyoptions.irpp.org/magazines/canadasworking-poor/how-unhealthy-are-poor-working-age-canadians/. Accessed March 16, 2020.
- <sup>40</sup> Cornish M. A Living Wage as a Human Right. Ontario: Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives; 2012. https://www.policyalternatives.ca/ sites/default/files/uploads/publications/Ontario%20Office/2012/10/Living%20Wage%20as%20a%20Human%20Right.pdf. Accessed March 16, 2020.
- <sup>41</sup> Brennan J, Ontario Office. Enhancing Democratic Citizenship, Deepening Distributive Justice: The Living Wage Movement. Toronto, Ont.: Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives, Ontario Office; 2012. https://www.policyalternatives.ca/publications/reports/enhancing-democraticcitizenship-deepening-distributive-justice. Accessed March 16, 2020.
- <sup>42</sup> Jackson A. Why paying a living wage makes good business sense. *The Globe and Mail*. https://www.theglobeandmail.com/report-onbusiness/economy/economy-lab/why-paying-a-living-wage-makes-good-business-sense/article5152175/. Published November 9, 2012. Accessed March 16, 2020.
- <sup>43</sup> Hyslop K. Is the "Living Wage" Enough? *The Tyee*. http://thetyee.ca/News/2012/05/14/Living-Wage-Enough/. Published May 14, 2012. Accessed March 16, 2020.
- <sup>44</sup> Living Wage. Vibrant Communities Calgary http://www.vibrantcalgary.com/vibrant-initiatives/living-wage/livingwage- advocacy. Accessed June 3, 2013.
- <sup>45</sup> Holzer HJ. *Living Wage Laws: How Much Do (Can) They Matter.* Brookings Institution Metropolitan Policy Program; 2008:41. https://www. brookings.edu/wp-content/uploads/2016/06/living\_wage\_report.pdf. Accessed March 16, 2020.
- <sup>46</sup> Neumark D, Thompson M, Koyle L. The effects of living wage laws on low-wage workers and low-income families: What do we know now? *J Labor Policy*. 2012;1(1):11. doi:10.1186/2193-9004-1-11

- <sup>47</sup> Employment and Wages for Alberta Workers with a Post-Secondary Education. :17.
- <sup>48</sup> Average Earnings of the Population 15 Years and over by Highest Level of Schooling, by Census Metropolitan Area. Statistics Canada, Census of Population, 2006 Census http://www.statcan.gc.ca/tables-tableaux/sum-som/l01/cst01/ labor51f-eng.htm. Accessed July 15, 2012.
- <sup>49</sup> Hankivsky O. Cost Estimates of Dropping Out of High School in Canada. Canadian Council on Learning; 2008:85.
- <sup>50</sup> Schellenberg G. 2003 General Social Survey on Social Engagement, Cycle 17: An Overview of Findings. Ottawa: Statistics Canada, Housing, Family and Social Statistics Division; 2004. http://epe.lac-bac.gc.ca/100/200/301/statcan/general\_social\_cycle\_17-e/89-598-XIE2003001.pdf. Accessed March 16, 2020.
- <sup>51</sup> Turcotte M. Social Engagement and Civic Participation: Are Rural and Small Town Populations Really at an Advantage? Ottawa: Statistics Canada; 2005. https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/n1/en/pub/21-006-x/21-006-x2005004-eng.pdf?st=mlurp7pN.
- <sup>52</sup> Milan A. Willing to Participate: Political Engagement of Young Adults. Statistics Canada; 2005. https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/n1/en/pub/11-008-x/2005003/article/8965-eng.pdf?st=LU4Zbzsw. Accessed March 16, 2020.
- <sup>53</sup> Education as a Determinant of Health. Public Health Agency of Canada; 2004. www.phac-aspc.gc.ca/ph-sp/phdd/overview\_ implications/10\_ education.html.
- <sup>54</sup> Hollingsworth M, Gunn T. Learning in the 21st Century: High School Completion for FNMI Students.; 2011.
- <sup>55</sup> Gunderson L, D'Silva RA, Odo DM. Immigrant Students Navigating Canadian Schools: A Longitudinal View. TESL. 2012;29:142. doi:10.18806/ tesl.v29i0.1114
- <sup>56</sup> Garnett B, Ungerleider C. An Introductory Look at the Academic Trajectories of ESL Students. Metropolis British Columbia; 2010. https://bcimmigrationmatters.wordpress.com/2010/08/29/an-introductory-look-at-the-academic-trajectories-of-esl-students/. Accessed March 16, 2020.
- <sup>57</sup> Watt D, Roessingh H. The Dynamics of ESL Drop-out: Plus Ça Change.... Canadian Modern Language Review. 2001;58(2):203-222. doi:10.3138/ cmlr.58.2.203
- <sup>58</sup> Derwing T, DeCorby E, Ichikawa J, Jamieson K. Some Factors That Affect the Success of ESL High School Students. *Canadian Modern Language Review*. 1999;55(4):532-547. doi:10.3138/cmlr.55.4.532
- <sup>59</sup> High School Completion Longitudinal Study. Edmonton, Alta.: Alberta Education; 2009. http://www.deslibris.ca/ID/223988. Accessed March 17, 2020.
- <sup>60</sup> McMullen K, Gilmore J. A note on high school graduation and school attendance, by age and province, 2009/2010. Education Matters: Insights on Education, Learning and Training in Canada. 7(4). https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/n1/pub/81-004-x/2010004/article/11360-eng.htm. Accessed March 17, 2020.
- <sup>61</sup> Interrupting High School and Returning to Education. Vol Issue 5. Ottawa: Statistics Canada, Council of Ministers of Education, Canada; 2010. https://www.cmec.ca/Publications/Lists/Publications/Attachments/224/81-599-x2010005-eng.pdf. Accessed March 17, 2020.
- <sup>62</sup> Heckman J, Humphries JE, Mader N. The GED. Cambridge, MA: National Bureau of Economic Research; 2010:w16064. doi:10.3386/w16064
- <sup>63</sup> Dan Bloom. Programs and Policies to Assist High School Dropouts in the Transition to Adulthood. *The Future of Children*. 2010;20(1):89-108. doi:10.1353/foc.0.0039
- <sup>64</sup> Styles T. Factors Influencing the Successful Completion of the General Educational Development (Ged) Preparation Program as Perceived by the Students. 2011.
- <sup>65</sup> Characteristics of GED Recipients in High School: 2002–06. U.S. Department of Education, Institute of Education Sciences, National Center for Education Statistics; 2011. https://nces.ed.gov/pubs2012/2012025.pdf. Accessed March 17, 2020.
- <sup>66</sup> Tyler J, Lofstrom M. Is the GED an Effective Route to Postsecondary Education for School Dropouts? Cambridge, MA: National Bureau of Economic Research; 2008:w13816. doi:10.3386/w13816
- <sup>67</sup> Marcotte J. Breaking Down the Forgotten Half: Exploratory Profiles of Youths in Quebec's Adult Education Centers. *Educational Researcher*. 2012;41(6):191-200. doi:10.3102/0013189X12445319
- <sup>68</sup> Holzer HJ. Workforce Development as an Antipoverty Strategy: What Do We Know? What Should We Do? Rochester, NY: Social Science Research Network; 2008. doi:10.1111/j.0042-7092.2007.00700.x
- <sup>69</sup> Wachen J, Jenkins D, Van Noy M. Integrating Basic Skills and Career-Technical Instruction: Findings From a Field Study of Washington State's I-BEST Model. *Community College Review*. 2011;39(2):136-159. doi:10.1177/0091552111406108
- <sup>70</sup> Building on Our Competencies: Canadian Results of the International Adult Literacy and Skills Survey. Ottawa: Statistics Canada, Ministry of Industry; 2003. https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/n1/pub/89-617-x/89-617-x2005001-eng.htm. Accessed March 17, 2020.

- <sup>71</sup> Green DA, Riddell WC. Literacy, Numeracy and Labour Market Outcomes in Canada. Ottawa: Statistics Canada, National Literacy Secretariat; 2001. https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/n1/en/pub/89-552-m/89-552-m2001008-eng.pdf?st=IU4IwppT. Accessed March 17, 2020.
- <sup>72</sup> Finnie R, Meng R. Perspectives on Labour and Income Literacy and employability. Perspectives on Labour and Income. 2007;8(3). https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/n1/pub/75-001-x/10307/9605-eng.htm. Accessed March 17, 2020.
- <sup>73</sup> Miller B, Esposito L, McCardle P. A Public Health Approach to Improving the Lives of Adult Learners: Introduction to the Special Issue on Adult Literacy Interventions. *Journal of Research on Educational Effectiveness*. 2011;4(2):87-100. doi:10.1080/19345747.2011.555287
- <sup>74</sup> Hock MF, Mellard DF. Efficacy of Learning Strategies Instruction in Adult Education. *Journal of Research on Educational Effectiveness*. 2011;4(2):134-153. doi:10.1080/19345747.2011.555291
- <sup>75</sup> Sabatini JP, Shore J, Holtzman S, Scarborough HS. Relative Effectiveness of Reading Intervention Programs for Adults With Low Literacy. Journal of Research on Educational Effectiveness. 2011;4(2):118-133. doi:10.1080/19345747.2011.555290
- <sup>76</sup> Meadows P, Metcalf H. Does literacy and numeracy training for adults increase employment and employability? Evidence from the Skills for Life programme in England. Industrial Relations Journal. 2008;39(5):354-369. doi:10.1111/j.1468-2338.2008.00493.x
- <sup>77</sup> Brooks G, Davies R, Duckett L, Hutchison D, Kendall S, Wilkin A. *Progress in Adult Literacy: Do Learners Learn?* London: Basic Skills Agency and National Foundation for Educational Research; 2001.
- <sup>78</sup> Beder H. The Outcomes and Impacts of Adult Literacy Education in the United States. Boston, MA: National Center for the Study of Adult Learning and Literacy; 1999. https://eric.ed.gov/?id=ED431870.
- <sup>79</sup> Covington LE. Moving beyond the Limits of Learning: Implications of Learning Disabilities for Adult Education. Adult Basic Education: An Interdisciplinary Journal for Adult Literacy Educational Planning. 2004;14(2):90-103.
- <sup>80</sup> Clark MA. Adult Education and Disability Studies, an Interdisciplinary Relationship: Research Implications for Adult Education. *Adult Education Quarterly*. 2006;56(4):308-322. doi:10.1177/0741713606289661
- <sup>81</sup> Serving High-Risk Youth Lessons from Research and Programming. Public/Private Ventures; 2002. https://hewlett.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/08/ServingHighRiskYouth.pdf. Accessed October 28, 2019.
- <sup>82</sup> Livermore M, Powers RS, Davis BC, Lim Y. Failing to Make Ends Meet: Dubious Financial Success Among Employed Former Welfare to Work Program Participants. J Fam Econ Iss. 2011;32(1):73-83. doi:10.1007/s10834-010-9192-5
- <sup>83</sup> Greenberg D, Robins PK. Have Welfare-to-Work Programs Improved Over Time in Putting Welfare Recipients to Work?
- <sup>84</sup> Cabrera NJ, Hutchens RM, Peters E, eds. From Welfare to Child Care: What Happens to Young Children When Single Mothers Exchange Welfare for Work? Mahwah, N.J: Lawrence Erlbaum; 2006.
- <sup>85</sup> Riddell C, Riddell WC. The pitfalls of work requirements in welfare-to-work policies: Experimental evidence on human capital accumulation in the Self-Sufficiency Project. *Journal of Public Economics*. 2014;117:39-49. doi:10.1016/j.jpubeco.2014.04.014
- <sup>86</sup> Michalopoulos C, Edin K, Fink B, et al. Welfare Reform in Philadelphia: Implementation, Effects, and Experiences of Poor Families and Neighborhoods. MDRC; 2003. http://www.ssrn.com/abstract=2717015. Accessed March 17, 2020.
- <sup>87</sup> Scott E. Welfare recipients struggle to balance work and family. Poverty Research News. 6(4):12-15.
- <sup>88</sup> Danziger SK, Seefeldt KS. Barriers to Employment and the 'Hard to Serve': Implications for Services, Sanctions, and Time Limits. Social Policy & Context, 2002;22(1):76-81. doi:10.1017/S1474746403001210
- <sup>89</sup> Shier ML, Jones ME, Graham JR. Employment Difficulties Experienced by Employed Homeless People: Labor Market Factors That Contribute to and Maintain Homelessness. *Journal of Poverty*. 2012;16(1):27-47. doi:10.1080/10875549.2012.640522
- <sup>90</sup> Wood RG, Moore Q, Rangarajan A. Two Steps Forward, One Step Back: The Uneven Economic Progress of TANF Recipients. Social Service Review. 2008;82(1):3-28. doi:10.1086/525035
- <sup>91</sup> LaDonna P, Kauff J. When Five Years Is Not Enough: Identifying and Addressing the Needs of Families Nearing the TANF Time Limit in Ramsey County, Minnesota. Mathematica Policy Research; 2006. https://www.mathematica.org/our-publications-and-findings/publications/whenfive-years-is-not-enough-identifying-and-addressing-the-needs-of-families-nearing-the-tanf-time-limit-in-ramsey-county-minnesota. Accessed March 17, 2020.
- <sup>92</sup> Michalopoulos C, Tattrie D, Miller C, et al. Making Work Pay Final Report on the Self-Sufficiency Project for Long-Term Welfare Recipients. MDRC, Social Research and Demonstration Corporation; 2002. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/246748386\_Making\_Work\_Pay\_Final\_ Report\_on\_the\_Self-Sufficiency\_Project\_for\_Long-Term\_Welfare\_Recipients. Accessed March 17, 2020.
- <sup>93</sup> Gottschalk P. Can work alter welfare recipients' beliefs? J Pol Anal Manage. 2005;24(3):485-498. doi:10.1002/pam.20111
- <sup>94</sup> Hamilton G, Scrivener S. Increasing Employment Stability and Earnings for Low-Wage Workers Lessons from the Employment Retention and Advancement (ERA) Project. Washington, D.C.: U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Office of Planning, Research, and Evaluation; 2012. http://www.ssrn.com/abstract=2067302. Accessed March 17, 2020.

- <sup>95</sup> Joona PA, Nekby L. Intensive Coaching of New Immigrants: An Evaluation Based on Random Program Assignment\*: Intensive coaching of new immigrants. *The Scandinavian Journal of Economics*. 2012;114(2):575-600. doi:10.1111/j.1467-9442.2011.01692.x
- <sup>96</sup> Alboim N, McIsaac E. Making the Connections: Ottawa's Role in Immigrant Employment. *IRBB Choices*. 2007;13(3). https://irpp.org/wp-content/ uploads/assets/research/diversity-immigration-and-integration/making-the-connections/vol13no3.pdf. Accessed March 17, 2020.
- <sup>97</sup> Werner EE, Smith RS. Overcoming the Odds: High Risk Children from Birth to Adulthood. Ithaca: Cornell University Press; 1992.
- <sup>98</sup> Hsueh J, Farrell M. Enhanced Early Head Start with Employment Services. U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Office of Planning, Research, and Evaluation; 2012. https://www.acf.hhs.gov/sites/default/files/opre/kansas\_missouri.pdf. Accessed March 17, 2020.
- <sup>99</sup> Trembath D, Balandin S, Stancliffe RJ, Togher L. Employment and Volunteering for Adults With Intellectual Disability: Employment and Volunteering. *Journal of Policy and Practice in Intellectual Disabilities*. 2010;7(4):235-238. doi:10.1111/j.1741-1130.2010.00271.x
- <sup>100</sup> Dutta A, Gervey R, Chan F, Chou C-C, Ditchman N. Vocational Rehabilitation Services and Employment Outcomes for People with Disabilities: A United States Study. J Occup Rehabil. 2008;18(4):326-334. doi:10.1007/s10926-008-9154-z
- <sup>101</sup> Martorell A, Gutierrez-Recacha P, Pereda A, Ayuso-Mateos JL. Identification of personal factors that determine work outcome for adults with intellectual disability. *Journal of Intellectual Disability Research*. 2008;52(12):1091-1101. doi:10.1111/j.1365-2788.2008.01098.x
- <sup>102</sup> Morgan McInnes M, Demet Ozturk O, McDermott S, Mann JR. Does supported employment work? J Pol Anal Manage. 2010;29(3):506-525. doi:10.1002/pam.20507
- <sup>103</sup> Swan S, Newton D. Supported Work-Based Training as a Route into Employment for Adults with Learning Disabilities. *Tizard Learning Disability Rev.* 2005;10(4):33-40. doi:10.1108/13595474200500036
- <sup>104</sup> Trembath D, Balandin S, Togher L, Stancliffe RJ. The experiences of adults with complex communication needs who volunteer. *Disability and Rehabilitation*. 2010;32(11):885-898. doi:10.3109/09638280903349537
- <sup>105</sup> Lefebvre P, Merrigan P, Michaud P-C. The Recent Evolution of Retirement Patterns in Canada. Institute for the Study of Labor (IZA); 2011. http://hdl.handle.net/10419/55114. Accessed March 17, 2020.
- <sup>106</sup> Uppal S. Seniors' Self-Employment.; 2011. https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/n1/pub/75-001-x/2011001/pdf/11400-eng.pdf. Accessed March 17, 2020.
- <sup>107</sup> Finance P, Retirement. RRSP: Have we given up on retirement saving? | Financial Post. https://financialpost.com/personal-finance/retirement/ have-we-given-up-on-retirement-saving. Published January 16, 2013. Accessed March 17, 2020.
- <sup>108</sup> Mintz JM, Wilson TA. Reform Proposals for Replenishing Retirement Savings. *The School of Public Policy Publications*. 2013;6. doi:10.11575/ SPPP.V6I0.42420
- <sup>109</sup> Labour Force Characteristics by Sex and Detailed Age Group, Annual. Statistics Canada; 2017. https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/t1/tbl1/en/tv.action?pid=1410001801. Accessed March 17, 2020.
- <sup>110</sup> Park J. Retirement, Health and Employment among Those 55 Plus. Statistics Canada; 2011. https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/n1/pub/75-001-x/2011001/article/11402/11402hl-fs-eng.htm. Accessed March 17, 2020.
- Report on the Labour Force Participation of Seniors and near Seniors, and Intergenerational Relations. Ottawa, Ont.; Gatineau, Que.: National Seniors Council; Human Resources and Skills Development Canada; 2011. https://www.deslibris.ca/ID/231522. Accessed March 17, 2020.
- <sup>112</sup> Canada's Economic Action Plan, Targeted Initiative for Older Workers. Government of Canada http://actionplan.gc.ca/en/initiative/targetedinitiative-older-workers. Accessed July 1, 2013.
- <sup>113</sup> Gyarmati D, de Raff S, Palameta B, et al. Engaging Communities in Support of Local Development: Measuring the Effects of the Community Employment Innovation Project on Communities. Ottawa, Ontario: Social Research and Demonstration Corporation; 2008. http://www.srdc.org/uploads/CEIP\_CER\_EN.pdf. Accessed March 17, 2020.
- <sup>114</sup> Gyarmati D, de Raaf S, Nicholson C, Kyte D, MacInnis M. Testing a Community-Based Jobs Strategy for the Unemployed: Early Impacts of the Community Employment Innovation Project.; 2006:166. http://www.srdc.org/uploads/CEIP-18-mo-full-report-English.pdf. Accessed March 17, 2020.
- <sup>115</sup> Gyarmati D, de Raff S, Nicholson C, Palameta B, Hui TS-W, MacInnis M. Improving Skills, Networks, and Livelihoods through Community-Based Work : Three-Year Impacts of the Community Employment Innovation Project. Ottawa, Ontario: Social Research and Demonstration Corporation; 2007. http://www.srdc.org/media/8544/CEIP\_Improving\_Skills\_EN.pdf. Accessed March 17, 2020.
- <sup>116</sup> Lengyel TE, Thompson C, Niesl PJ, Families International (Milwaukee Wis), Metropolitan Life Foundation. *Strength in Adversity: The Resourcefulness of American Families in Need*. Milwaukee, Wis.: Family Service America, Inc., Families International, Inc.; 1997.
- <sup>117</sup> Danziger SK, Carlson M, Henley JR. Post-welfare employment and psychological well-being. In: Lennon MC, ed. Welfare, Work, and Well-Being. New York, NY: Hawoth Medical Press.
- <sup>118</sup> Edin K, Lein L. Making Ends Meet: How Single Mothers Survive Welfare and Low-Wage Work. New York, NY: Russell Sage Foundation; 1997.

- <sup>119</sup> Aguilera MB, Massey DS. Social Capital and the Wages of Mexican Migrants: New Hypotheses and Tests. *Social Forces*. 2003;82(2):671-701. doi:10.1353/sof.2004.0001
- <sup>120</sup> Nee V, Sanders J. Understanding the diversity of immigrant incorporation: a forms-of-capital model. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*. 2001;24(3):386-411. doi:10.1080/01419870020036710
- <sup>121</sup> Li PS. Social capital and economic outcomes for immigrants and ethnic minorities. *Int Migration & Integration*. 2004;5(2):171-190. doi:10.1007/ s12134-004-1008-8
- <sup>122</sup> Thomas D. *Personal Networks and the Economic Adjustment of Immigrants*. Statistics Canada; 2011. https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/n1/en/ pub/11-008-x/2011002/article/11592-eng.pdf?st=YT0nWxba. Accessed March 18, 2020.
- <sup>123</sup> Xue L. Social Capital and Employment Entry of Recent Immigrants to Canada: Evidence from the Longitudinal Survey of Immigrants to Canada. Citizenship and Immigration Canada; 2008:58. https://www.canada.ca/content/dam/ircc/migration/ircc/english/pdf/research-stats/social-capital-w3-eng.pdf. Accessed March 18, 2020.
- <sup>124</sup> Warman CR. Ethnic Neighbourhoods and Male Immigrant Earnings Growth: 1981 through 1996. Ottawa, Ontario: Statistics Canada; 2005. https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/n1/en/pub/11f0019m/11f0019m2005241-eng.pdf?st=eWukJuzE. Accessed March 18, 2020.
- <sup>125</sup> Beaman LA. Social Networks and the Dynamics of Labour Market Outcomes: Evidence from Refugees Resettled in the U.S. *The Review of Economic Studies*. 2012;79(1):128-161. doi:10.1093/restud/rdr017
- <sup>126</sup> Kanas A, van Tubergen F, Van der Lippe T. The role of social contacts in the employment status of immigrants: A panel study of immigrants in Germany. *International Sociology*. 2011;26(1):95-122. doi:10.1177/0268580910380977
- <sup>127</sup> Kanas A. The economic performance of immigrants: the role of human and social capital. 2011. https://dspace.library.uu.nl/handle/1874/204798. Accessed March 18, 2020.
- <sup>128</sup> State Asset Development Report Card: Benchmarking Asset Development in Fighting Poverty. Washington, D.C.: Corporation for Enterprise Development; 2002.
- <sup>129</sup> McKernan S-M, Ratcliffe C. Enabling Families to Weather Emergencies and Develop: The Role of Assets. Urban Institute; 2008:30. https://www.urban.org/sites/default/files/publication/33116/411734-enabling-families-to-weather-emergencies-and-develop.pdf. Accessed March 18, 2020.
- <sup>130</sup> Social and Enterprise Development Innovations (SEDI). *Financial Capability and Poverty Discussion Paper*. Government of Canada, Policy Research Initiative; 2004. http://publications.gc.ca/collections/Collection/PH4-11-2004E.pdf. Accessed March 18, 2020.
- <sup>131</sup> Drexler A, Fischer G, Schoar A. Keeping It Simple: Financial Literacy and Rules of Thumb. *American Economic Journal: Applied Economics*. 2014;6(2):1-31. doi:10.1257/app.6.2.1
- <sup>132</sup> Servon LJ, Kaestner R. Consumer Financial Literacy and the Impact of Online Banking on the Financial Behavior of Lower-Income Bank Customers. *Journal of Consumer Affairs*. 2008;42(2):271-305. doi:10.1111/j.1745-6606.2008.00108.x
- <sup>133</sup> Tufano P, Flacke T, Maynard NW. Better Financial Decision Making among Low-Income and Minority Groups: RAND corporation; 2010. https://www.rand.org/pubs/working\_papers/WR795.html. Accessed March 18, 2020.
- <sup>134</sup> Agarwal S, Amromin G, Ben-David I, Chomsisengphet S, Evanoff D. Do Financial Counseling Mandates Improve Mortgage Choice and Performance? Evidence from a Legislative Experiment. *Federal Reserve Bank of Chicago, Working Paper Series*. 2009.
- <sup>135</sup> Hartarska V, Gonzalez-Vega C. Evidence on the effect of credit counseling on mortgage loan default by low-income households. *Journal of Housing Economics*. 2006;15(1):63-79. doi:10.1016/j.jhe.2006.02.002
- <sup>136</sup> Robson J. The Case for Financial Literacy: Assessing the Effects of Financial Literacy Interventions for Low Income and Vulnerable Groups in Canada. Social Enterprise Development Innovations (SEDI), Canadian Centre for Financial Literacy; 2012:60. http://theccfl.ca/CCFL/media/CCFL-Library/PDF/The-Case-for-Financial-Literacy-EN.pdf. Accessed March 18, 2020.
- <sup>137</sup> Social and Enterprise Development Innovations (SEDI). www.sedi.org/html/programs/faqAssetsBuilding.asp.
- <sup>138</sup> Leckie N, Hui TS-W, Tattrie D, Robson J, Voyer J-P. Learning to Save, Saving to Learn: Learn\$ave Individual Development Accounts Project Final Report. Ottawa, Ontario: Social Research and Demonstration Corporation; 2010. http://www.srdc.org/uploads/learnsave\_final\_en.pdf. Accessed March 18, 2020.
- <sup>139</sup> Kingwell P, Dowie M, Holler B, Jimenez L. Helping People Help Themselves An Early Look at Learn\$ave The Learn\$ave Project. Ottawa, Ontario: Social Research and Demonstration Corporation; 2004. http://www.srdc.org/media/10149/learnsave\_early\_look.pdf. Accessed March 18, 2020.
- <sup>140</sup> Kingwell P, Dowie M, Holler B, Vincent C, Gyarmati D, Cao H. Design and Implementation of a Program to Help the Poor Save The Learn\$ave Project. Ottawa, Ontario: Social Research and Demonstration Corporation; 2005. http://www.srdc.org/media/10218/learnsave\_implementation.pdf. Accessed March 18, 2020.

- <sup>141</sup> Leckie N, Dowle M, Gyorfi-Dkye C. Learning to Save, Saving to Learn: Learn\$ave Individual Development Accounts Project: Early Impact. Ottawa, Ontario: Social Research and Demonstration Corporation; 2009:115. http://www.srdc.org/media/10170/learnsave\_full\_EN.pdf.
- <sup>142</sup> Bates L. Fees for Cashing Government Cheques: Final Report. Toronto, Ont.: Law Commission of Ontario; 2008. http://ra.ocls.ca/ra/login.aspx?ins t=centennial&url=https://www.deslibris.ca/ID/217076. Accessed March 18, 2020.
- <sup>143</sup> Pyper W. Perspectives on Labour and Income Payday Loans. Statistics Canada; 2007. https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/n1/pub/75-001x/10407/9617-eng.htm. Accessed March 18, 2020.
- <sup>144</sup> Coyle M, Wehrel R. Small is Beautiful, Big is Necessary; Canada's Commercial and Cooperative Answers to the Global Challenge of Microfinance Access. In: Halifax, Nova Scotia; 2006. http://www.microcreditsummit.org/papers/Plenaries/Canadian per cent20Plenary\_ Coyle\_ENG.pdf.
- <sup>145</sup> Microentrepreneurs and Their Businesses: 2008 MicroTest Outcomes. Washington, D.C.: The Aspen Institute. https://assets.aspeninstitute.org/ content/uploads/2017/07/MTOutcomes08-Microentrepreneurs.pdf?\_ga=2.4862900.643764573.1584566224-1331624072.1584566224. Accessed March 18, 2020.
- <sup>146</sup> Klein J, Alisultanov I, Blair A. Microenterprise as a Welfare to Work Strategy: Two-Year Findings. The Aspen Institute; 2003. https://www.aspeninstitute.org/publications/microenterprise-welfare-work-strategy-two-year-findings/. Accessed March 18, 2020.
- <sup>147</sup> Jackson ET, Tarsilla M. Micro-lending to Immigrants: Corporate Social Responsibility or Core Growth Strategy? Evaluating the Micro-Loan Program of a Canadian Credit Union. In: Concordia University, Montreal; June 2, 20110. http://www.euricse.eu/sites/default/files/ db\_uploads/ documents/1281100743\_n618.pdf. Accessed September 15, 2012.
- <sup>148</sup> Newman SJ. Does housing matter for poor families? A critical summary of research and issues still to be resolved. *J Pol Anal Manage*. 2008;27(4):895-925. doi:10.1002/pam.20381
- <sup>149</sup> Newman S, Holupka CS, Harkness J. The long-term effects of housing assistance on work and welfare. *J Pol Anal Manage*. 2009;28(1):81-101. doi:10.1002/pam.20403
- <sup>150</sup> Newman SJ, Harkness JM. The long-term effects of public housing on self-sufficiency. J Pol Anal Manage. 2002;21(1):21. doi:10.1002/pam.1038
- <sup>151</sup> Shroder M. Does housing assistance perversely affect self-sufficiency? A review essay. *Journal of Housing Economics*. 2002;11(4):381-417. doi:10.1016/S1051-1377(02)00128-6
- <sup>152</sup> Kirkpatrick SI, Tarasuk V. Housing Circumstances are Associated with Household Food Access among Low-Income Urban Families. *J Urban Health*. 2011;88(2):284-296. doi:10.1007/s11524-010-9535-4
- <sup>153</sup> Kirkpatrick SI, Tarasuk V. Adequacy of food spending is related to housing expenditures among lower-income Canadian households. *Public Health Nutr.* 2007;10(12):1464-1473. doi:10.1017/S136898000700081X
- <sup>154</sup> Garasky S, Fletcher CN, Jensen HH. Transiting to Work: The Role of Private Transportation for Low-Income Households. *Journal of Consumer Affairs*. 2006;40(1):64-89. doi:10.1111/j.1745-6606.2006.00046.x
- <sup>155</sup> Ong PM. Car ownership and welfare-to-work. J Pol Anal Manage. 2002;21(2):239-252. doi:10.1002/pam.10025
- <sup>156</sup> Glossary of globalization, trade and health terms. WHO. http://www.who.int/trade/glossary/story028/en.
- <sup>157</sup> Power EM. Determinants of Healthy Eating Among Low-income Canadians. *Canadian Journal of Public Health*. 2005;96 suppl 3(July-August). https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/569f/a1c6d2f54fa5ca8a72393a85df054c322f57.pdf. Accessed March 19, 2020.
- <sup>158</sup> The Consequences of Hunger and Food Insecurity for Children: Evidence from Recent Scientific Studies. Brandeis University, Waltham, MA: Center on Hunger and Poverty; 2002.
- <sup>159</sup> Anderson PM, Butcher KF (Kristin F. Childhood Obesity: Trends and Potential Causes. *The Future of Children*. 2006;16(1):19-45. doi:10.1353/ foc.2006.0001
- <sup>160</sup> National Research Council (US) and Institute of Medicine (US) Committee on Integrating the Science of Early Childhood Development. From Neurons to Neighborhoods: The Science of Early Childhood Development. (Shonkoff JP, Phillips DA, eds.). Washington (DC): National Academies Press (US); 2000. http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/books/NBK225557/. Accessed March 19, 2020.
- <sup>161</sup> Bronte-Tinkew J, Zaslow M, Horowitz A, Capps RC. Food Insecurity and Overweight among Infants and Toddlers: New Insights into a Troubling Linkage. Washington, D.C.: Child Trends; 2007. https://www.childtrends.org/wp-content/uploads/2007/07/Child\_Trends-2007\_07\_11\_RB\_ FoodInsecurity.pdf. Accessed March 19, 2020.
- <sup>162</sup> Hastert TA, Babey SH, Diamant AL, Brown ER. Low-Income Adolescents Face More Barriers to Healthy Weight. Los Angeles, CA: UCLA Center for Health Policy Research; 2008:1-8.
- <sup>163</sup> Whitaker RC, Phillips SM, Orzol SM. Food Insecurity and the Risks of Depression and Anxiety in Mothers and Behavior Problems in their Preschool-Aged Children. *Pediatrics*. 2006;118(3):e859-e868. doi:10.1542/peds.2006-0239

- <sup>164</sup> Heflin CM, Siefert K, Williams DR. Food insufficiency and women's mental health: Findings from a 3-year panel of welfare recipients. Social Science & Medicine. 2005;61(9):1971-1982. doi:10.1016/j.socscimed.2005.04.014
- <sup>165</sup> Roustit C, Hamelin A-M, Grillo F, Martin J, Chauvin P. Food Insecurity: Could School Food Supplementation Help Break Cycles of Intergenerational Transmission of Social Inequalities? *Pediatrics*. 2010;126(6):1174-1181. doi:10.1542/peds.2009-3574
- <sup>166</sup> Bartfeld JS, Ahn H-M. The School Breakfast Program Strengthens Household Food Security among Low-Income Households with Elementary School Children. *The Journal of Nutrition*. 2011;141(3):470-475. doi:10.3945/jn.110.130823
- <sup>167</sup> Iacovou M, Pattieson DC, Truby H, Palermo C. Social health and nutrition impacts of community kitchens: a systematic review. *Public Health Nutr.* 2013;16(3):535-543. doi:10.1017/S1368980012002753
- <sup>168</sup> Tarasuk V, Reynolds R. A Qualitative Study of Community Kitchens as a Response to Income-Related Food Insecurity. *Can J Diet Pract Res.* 1999;60(1):11-16.
- <sup>169</sup> Crawford S, Kalina L. Building food security through health promotion: Community kitchens. *Journal of the Canadian Dietetic Association*. 1997;58(4).
- <sup>170</sup> Engler-Stringer R, Berenbaum S. Exploring food security with collective kitchens participants in three Canadian cities. *Qual Health Res.* 2007;17(1):75-84. doi:10.1177/1049732306296451
- <sup>171</sup> Government of Ontario. Ontario Supportive Housing Best Practice Guide. March 2017. http://www.mah.gov.on.ca/AssetFactory. aspx?did=15988. Accessed February 27, 2020.
- <sup>172</sup> Addictions & Mental Health Ontario. Promising Practices: 12 Case Studies in Supportive Housing for People with Mental Health and Addiction Issues. April 2018. https://www.homelesshub.ca/resource/promising-practices-12-case-studies-supportive-housing-people-mental-healthand-addiction. Accessed February 27, 2020.
- <sup>173</sup> Limited AH and URI. Australian Housing and Urban Research Institute, Research library. AHURI. https://www.ahuri.edu.au/research/researchlibrary. Published October 18, 2018. Accessed February 20, 2020.
- <sup>174</sup> BC Housing Research Library. https://www.bchousing.org/research-centre/library. Accessed February 20, 2020.
- <sup>175</sup> Munthe-Kaas HM, Berg RC, Blaasvær N. Effectiveness of interventions to reduce homelessness: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *Campbell Systematic Reviews*. 2018;14(1):1-281. doi:10.4073/csr.2018.3
- <sup>176</sup> Canham S, O'Dea E, Wister A. Evaluating the Housing First Approach in the Metro Vancouver Region. April 2017. https://www.homelesshub. ca/resource/evaluating-housing-first-approach-metro-vancouver-region.
- <sup>177</sup> H&R Block College Financial Aid Application Assistance. Social Programs that Work. https://evidencebasedprograms.org/programs/hr-blockcollege-financial-aid-application-assistance/. Accessed April 8, 2020.
- <sup>178</sup> Learning Accounts. Social Programs that Work. https://evidencebasedprograms.org/programs/learning-accounts/. Accessed April 8, 2020.
- <sup>179</sup> White A, Dragicevic N, Granofsky T. What Works? Proven Approaches to Alleviating Poverty. Mowat Centre and University of Toronto; n.d. https://munkschool.utoronto.ca/mowatcentre/wp-content/uploads/publications/95\_what\_works\_full.pdf. Accessed April 15, 2020.
- <sup>180</sup> Mawn L, Oliver EJ, Akhter N, et al. Are we failing young people not in employment, education or training (NEETs)? A systematic review and meta-analysis of re-engagement interventions. *Syst Rev.* 2017;6. doi:10.1186/s13643-016-0394-2
- <sup>181</sup> Duvendack M, Mader P. Impact of financial inclusion in low- and middle-income countries: A systematic review of reviews. *Campbell Systematic Reviews*. 2019;15(1-2). doi:10.4073/csr.2019.2
- <sup>182</sup> Kluve J, Puerto S, Robalino D, et al. Interventions to improve the labour market outcomes of youth: A systematic review of training, entrepreneurship promotion, employment services and subsidized employment interventions. *Campbell Systematic Reviews*. 2017;13(1):1-288. doi:10.4073/csr.2017.12
- <sup>183</sup> Publications Prosper Canada. http://prospercanada.org/Resources/Publications.aspx. Accessed February 24, 2020.
- <sup>184</sup> The Social Research and Demonstration Corporation Older workers. The Social Research and Demonstration Corporation –. http://www.srdc.org/populations-we-work-with/older-workers.aspx. Accessed April 15, 2020.
- <sup>185</sup> The Social Research and Demonstration Corporation Low-skilled workers. The Social Research and Demonstration Corporation. http://www.srdc.org/populations-we-work-with/low-skilled-workers.aspx. Accessed April 15, 2020.
- <sup>186</sup> Kasman M, Heuberger B, Hammond RA. A Review of Large-Scale Youth Financial Literacy Education Policies and Programs. October 2018. https://www.brookings.edu/wp-content/uploads/2018/10/ES\_20181001\_Financial-Literacy-Review.pdf.
- <sup>187</sup> Best Practices for Financial Literacy and Education at Institutions of Higher Education. U.S. Financial Literacy and Education Commission; 2019. https://home.treasury.gov/system/files/136/Best-Practices-for-Financial-Literacy-and-Education-at-Institutions-of-Higher-Education2019.pdf. Accessed April 15, 2020.

- <sup>188</sup> Lee N, Beeler Stücklin S, Lopez Rodriguez P, El Alaoui Faris M, Mukaka I. Financial education for HIV-vulnerable youth, orphans, and vulnerable children: A systematic review of outcome evidence. *Campbell Systematic Reviews*. 2020;16(1). doi:10.1002/cl2.1071
- <sup>189</sup> Research | Global Financial Literacy Excellence Center (GFLEC). https://gflec.org/research/?type=publications. Accessed February 24, 2020.
- <sup>190</sup> Neumark D. Inventory of Research on Economic Self-Sufficiency. Economic Self-Sufficiency Policy Research Institute; 2016. https://www.esspri.uci.edu/files/docs/2016/2016%20ESSPRI%20Preliminary%20Research%20Inventory.pdf.
- <sup>191</sup> Self-Sufficiency Research Clearinghouse. Self-Sufficiency Research Clearinghouse. https://www.opressrc.org/content/publications. Accessed February 20, 2020.
- <sup>192</sup> Social Programs That Work Employment and Welfare. Social Programs that Work. https://evidencebasedprograms.org/policy\_area/ employment-welfare/. Accessed April 14, 2020.
- <sup>193</sup> Family Self Sufficiency Training Program. https://www.hudexchange.info/trainings/fss-program-online-training/1.2-what-is-fss.html. Accessed February 20, 2020.
- <sup>194</sup> Self-Sufficiency, Welfare & Employment. Self-Sufficiency Research Clearinghouse. https://www.acf.hhs.gov/opre/research/topic/overview/ self-sufficiency-welfare-employment. Accessed February 20, 2020.
- <sup>195</sup> The Social Research and Demonstration Corporation Programs for Social Assistance Recipients. The Social Research and Demonstration Corporation. http://www.srdc.org/populations-we-work-with/social-assistance-recipients.aspx
- <sup>196</sup> Effective Literacy and Numeracy Practices Database LitBase. UNESCO Institute for Lifelong Learning. https://uil.unesco.org/literacy/ effective-practices-database-litbase. Published July 1, 2016. Accessed April 16, 2020.
- <sup>197</sup> Adult Literacy and Essential Skills Research Institute | Bow Valley College. https://centreforfoundationallearning.wordpress.com/. Accessed February 26, 2020.
- <sup>198</sup> National Research Council (U.S.), Lesgold AM, Welch-Ross MK, eds. *Improving Adult Literacy Instruction: Options for Practice and Research*. Washington, D.C: The National Academies Press; 2012. http://nap.edu/13242.
- <sup>199</sup> Banulescu-Bogdan N. Beyond Work: Reducing Social Isolation for Refugee Women and Other Marginalized Newcomers. Washington, D.C.: Migration Policy Institute; 2020. https://www.migrationpolicy.org/research/reducing-social-isolation-refugee-women-newcomers.
- <sup>200</sup> Myers K, Conte N. Building New Skills: Immigration and Workforce Development in Canada. Washington, D.C.: Migration Policy Institute; 2013.
- <sup>201</sup> Ott E, Montgomery P. Interventions to Improve the Economic Self-sufficiency and Well-being of Resettled Refugees: A Systematic Review. *Campbell Systematic Reviews*. 2015;11(1):1-53. doi:10.4073/csr.2015.4
- <sup>202</sup> Social Research and Demonstration Corporation New immigrants. http://www.srdc.org/populations-we-work-with/new-immigrants.aspx. Accessed February 27, 2020.
- <sup>203</sup> Fleming P, McGilloway S, Hernon M, et al. Individualized funding interventions to improve health and social care outcomes for people with a disability: A mixed-methods systematic review. *Campbell Systematic Reviews*. 2019;15(1-2). doi:10.4073/csr.2019.3
- <sup>204</sup> Canadian Centre on Disability Studies | Home. http://www.disabilitystudies.ca/. Accessed February 26, 2020.
- <sup>205</sup> Center for Employment and Disability Research | Kessler Foundation. https://kesslerfoundation.org/research/center-employment-anddisability-research. Accessed February 26, 2020.
- <sup>206</sup> CRWDP | Centre for Research on Work Disability Policy. https://www.crwdp.ca/. Accessed February 26, 2020.
- <sup>207</sup> Prince MJ. Inclusive Employment for Canadians with Disabilities Toward a New Policy Framework and Agenda. Institute for Research on Public Policy; 2016. http://irpp.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/08/study-no60.pdf. Accessed April 15, 2020.
- <sup>208</sup> Social Insurance Programs INSTITUTE FOR RESEARCH ON POVERTY UW–Madison. https://www.irp.wisc.edu/category/economic-support/ social-insurance-programs/. Published 2020. Accessed February 20, 2020.